

# CMI REPORT

Evaluation:  
Norwegian Student and Academics'  
International Assistance Fund's (SAIH)  
Cooperation with the  
Bolivian Unidades Academicas Campesinas  
(Peasant Academic Units (UACs))

Dr John-Andrew McNeish  
Ana Cecilia Arteaga Böhr

**R 2008: 7**



Evaluation:  
Norwegian Student and Academics'  
International Assistance Fund's (SAIH)  
Cooperation with the  
Bolivian *Unidades Academicas Campesinas*  
(Peasant Academic Units (*UACs*))

Dr John-Andrew McNeish  
Ana Cecilia Arteaga Böhr

**R 2008: 7**

### **CMI Reports**

This series can be ordered from:

Chr. Michelsen Institute  
P.O. Box 6033 Postterminalen,  
N-5892 Bergen, Norway  
Tel: + 47 55 57 40 00  
Fax: + 47 55 57 41 66  
E-mail: [cmi@cmi.no](mailto:cmi@cmi.no)  
[www.cmi.no](http://www.cmi.no)

Price: NOK 50

Printed version: ISSN 0805-505X  
Electronic version: ISSN 1890-503X

Printed version: ISBN 978-82-8062-268-6  
Electronic version: ISBN 978-82-8062-269-3

This report is also available at:  
[www.cmi.no/publications](http://www.cmi.no/publications)

### **Indexing terms**

Bolivia  
Unidades Academicas Campesinas (UACs)  
Indigenous peoples  
Education

### **Project number**

28021

### **Project title**

Norwegian Student and Academics' International Assistance Fund's (SAIH) Cooperation with the Bolivian *Unidades Academicas Campesinas* (Peasant Academic Units (UACs))

# Contents

<b>Summary .....</b>	<b>iv</b>
<b>1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2. Background .....</b>	<b>3</b>
2.2 SAIH and Education for Development .....	3
2.3 SAIH's Assistance to Bolivia .....	4
2.4 The Sense of a Special Focus: Indigenous Peoples in Bolivia .....	4
2.5 Current Work in Bolivia .....	5
2.6 Unidades Académicas Campesinas (UACs).....	5
UAC Batallas .....	6
UAC Escoma .....	7
UAC Tiahuanaco.....	8
UAC Pucarani .....	9
Project for the Inter-Institutional Development of the UACS (Inter-UAC).....	10
<b>3. Criteria for Evaluation .....</b>	<b>11</b>
3.1 Strengthened as Higher Education Institutions Working with Indigenous Peoples? .....	11
3.2 Working in line with SAIH's Education for Development Strategy?.....	12
3.3 Role in the New Political Context?.....	13
<b>4. Analysis and Conclusions .....</b>	<b>15</b>
4.1 Strengthened as Higher Education Institutions Working with Indigenous Peoples? .....	15
UAC Batallas .....	16
UAC Escoma .....	16
UAC Tiahuanaco.....	17
UAC Pucarani .....	17
Project for the Inter-Institutional Development of the UACS (Inter-UAC).....	18
4.2 Working in line with SAIH's Education for Development Strategy?.....	18
UAC Batallas .....	21
UAC Escoma .....	21
UAC Tiahuanaco.....	22
UAC Pucarani .....	22
Project for the Inter-Institutional Development of the UACS (Inter-UAC).....	23
4.3 Role in the New Political Context?.....	23
<b>5. Recommendations.....</b>	<b>25</b>
Annex 1. TÉRMINOS DE REFERENCIA.....	28
Annex 2: SAIH Financing 2006-2008 .....	33
Annex 3: LISTA DE ENTREVISTADOS/AS .....	37
Bibliography.....	39

## Summary

The Norwegian Students' and Academics' International Assistance Fund (SAIH) is a solidarity organisation focused on contributing to political, civil, economic, social and cultural liberation in countries in the South. Since 1993 SAIH has cooperated with and provided assistance to four Peasant Academic Units (Unidades Academicas Campesinos, UACs) in the Highlands of Bolivia. The UACs were created by the Catholic Church of Bolivia with the aim of reducing the social injustices experienced by the indigenous population of Bolivia throughout its Republican and Colonial history. Originally financed by Operasjon Dagsverk (OD) in the context of marking 500 years of indigenous resistance to colonialism the agreement between SAIH and the UACs sought to create the foundation in Bolivia for culturally sensitive education and support the rights of local indigenous peoples. In the course of the 1990s this agreement was expanded through Norad financing. Following many years of support the four UACs now form the majority focus of SAIH support to Bolivia. Whilst there is no sign of any immediate change in this relationship, both SAIH and Norad have been aware of the changing political relations in the country and of the changing context and possibilities for education in Bolivia. This has generated concern within SAIH about the continuing validity and value of their external support to the UACs and in turn generated a set of justifications for evaluation. In line with the terms of reference created by SAIH the main questions asked in this evaluation are:

1. To what degree has the cooperation with SAIH strengthened the UACs as higher education institutions with particular focus on indigenous peoples?
2. How do the UACs relate to SAIH Strategy for Education for Development 2008-2012?
3. What role do the UACs play in the new political context of Bolivia?

On the basis of field research and a series of interviews carried out in May 2008, the evaluation concludes positively in response to the first two of these questions. The evaluation concludes that the cooperation with SAIH has strengthened the UACs as higher education institutions with particular focus on indigenous peoples. It concludes that the UACs are evidently working in line with SAIH's strategy for "education for development". The evaluation describes in detail the basis of these qualitative judgements. Whilst returning positive answers to these questions the evaluation does, however, underline that a range of improvements need to be made by the UACs in order to ensure their sustainability and to develop and expand their significance as "actors for change". The evaluation concludes that as a result of poor foresight and cooperation, coupled with the confusing and divided political reality of Bolivian politics, the UACs do not currently play an important role in the new political context of Bolivia. Work needs to be done to better cooperate and profile the particular inter-cultural and bilingual education offered by the UACs in a range of appropriate areas for local development. With improved vision of their possibilities, and stronger explicit fronting of indigenous rights, the UACs have the potential to not only be contributors to local education and development, but to become a successful model for national education reform and practice. On the basis of these conclusions the evaluation ends with a set of 15 basic recommendations.

# 1. Introduction

In 1993 the Norwegian Student and Academics' International Assistance Fund (SAIH) entered into a cooperation agreement with the *Unidad Académica Campesina* (Peasant Academic Unity, or UAC) in the *altiplano* community of Tiahuanaco close to Lake Titicaca in Bolivia. Financed by Operasjon Dagsverk (OD) in the context of marking 500 years of indigenous resistance to colonialism the agreement sought to create the foundation in Bolivia for culturally sensitive education and support the rights of local indigenous peoples. In the course of the 1990s this agreement was expanded through Norad financing and agreement with the local Catholic Church and the Bolivian Catholic University of San Pablo in La Paz- who had initially founded these rural universities. With SAIH's support, three new UACs were also further developed in the highland communities of Batallas, Escoma and Pucarani. Now following many years of support the four UACs now form the majority focus of SAIH in Bolivia. Whilst there is no sign of any immediate change in this relationship, both SAIH and Norad have been aware of the changing political relations in the country and of the changing context and possibilities for education in Bolivia. This has generated concern within SAIH about the continuing validity and value of their external support to the UACs and in turn generated a set of justifications for evaluation:

- a) There is a new political context in Bolivia, in which the situation of indigenous peoples has changed at the macro level.
- b) SAIH currently operates according to SAIH's Strategic Plan of Education for Development 2008-2012, and wants to evaluate current cooperation and plans for the future in relation to this strategy.
- c) Cooperation has lasted for a number of years and SAIH needs to know more about the results and benefits of the projects.

The current evaluation study responds directly to these justifications and aims to fulfil the objectives of the evaluation stated in the Terms of Reference for the evaluation (Annex 1). As such, it seeks to interpret the role of the UACs in the new context of Bolivia and to propose possible strategies for the future. The evaluation further aims to present and evaluate the results and challenges of the project as a means to assist the internal planning and work of the UACs. The report below will also present and evaluate the results and challenges in order to assist SAIH in its future planning and identification of relevant partners. It will propose strategies for cooperation and sustainability for the future. Of clear importance, it will also respond to the three key questions stated in the TOR:

1. To what degree has the cooperation with SAIH strengthened the UACS as higher education institutions with particular focus on indigenous peoples?
2. What role do the UACs play in the new political context of Bolivia?
3. How do the UACs relate to SAIH Strategy for Education for Development 2008-2012?

In further meeting with the TOR the evaluation team accepted by SAIH for this evaluation has included two experienced evaluators with knowledge of Bolivia, the language, development and indigenous issues : one from a Norwegian research institution i.e. John-Andrew McNeish (Senior Researcher at CMI) and one from Bolivia i.e. Ana Cecilia Arteaga Böhr (a Social Psychologist connected to the Postgraduate Centre for the Study of Development and the Environment (CIDES) at the Universidad Mayor de San Andres). The evaluation team has carried out its work in keeping

with the qualitative methodology stated in the TOR i.e. documental study, individual and group interviews and direct participatory observation (please see Annex 2 for a complete list of interviews). An initial meeting and interview with the SAIH secretariat and elected student representatives was carried out in Oslo at the start of May. Fieldwork in Bolivia and visits to each of the UAC locations was carried out over a period of two and half weeks at the end of May/start of June 2008. A series of further interviews including the Ministry of Education, the Catholic University in La Paz and the Norwegian Embassy Section were also carried out to gain understanding of the standing and significance of the UACS in Bolivia<sup>1</sup>. A group meeting and interview was held in La Paz to discuss the Inter-UAC cooperation and brainstorm around possibilities for project sustainability. A series of documental sources were consulted in the writing of this final evaluation report e.g. earlier reports, project documents and evaluations of SAIH and the UACs, academic articles and official documents such as the Bolivian government proposal for education reform. The writing of both the English and Spanish versions of this final 30 page evaluation report was furthermore completed within the six weeks specified for the study and submitted in their entirety to the SAIH at the end of June 2008.

---

<sup>1</sup> Efforts were also made to arrange an interview with the Bishop of La Paz. However, repeated absence by the Bishop on the date of the interview made the completion of this interview impossible.



## 2. Background

### 2.2 SAIH and Education for Development

The Norwegian Students' and Academics' International Assistance Fund (SAIH) is a solidarity organisation focused on contributing to political, civil, economic, social and cultural liberation in the countries of the South. As a non-governmental organisation SAIH clearly distinguishes its work from others through their use of the slogan "Education for Liberation" (See Education for Development Strategy: "Education for Liberation: Development Based on Knowledge and Solidarity 2008-2012"). As this slogan makes evident, the work of SAIH clearly echoes the influential Brazilian priest and thinker Paulo Freire's theories on pedagogy for liberation, in which active participation is held to create increased political consciousness and provide each participant with greater opportunities for seeking solutions to their own problems. According to SAIH education must be placed in a social context, where it will assist in creating a more just society. Good education enlightens, raises awareness, develops and liberates individuals, groups and communities as well as providing people with the tools for critical and independent thinking. Awareness of one's own situation and role in society is a precondition for development and democracy. In order for education to have a liberating effect in a society it must be founded on local traditions and socio-cultural conditions. SAIH states that it aims for all its projects and programmes to take into consideration national and local conditions in a respectful and professional way.

SAIH's work towards the democratisation of education has a clear basis in wider thinking on rights and participation. Aware that educational institutions in are not in their own right sufficient to create liberational outcomes, SAIH backs the idea of the formation of "change agents". To ensure that education becomes a mean for development it states in its 2008-2012 Strategic Plan "Education for Liberation: Development based on Knowledge and Solidarity" that it is critical to consider a series of issues: the quality of the curriculum, teaching methods and research, but also the students' and pupils' opportunities to take part in, and influence the decision-making (2008:8). Change agents, or individuals able to actively participate in political processes and civil society, can create social change and make governments accountable. In the context of SAIH this also applies both for students and academics. SAIH states that it aims to address the root-causes that prevent social and political participation. Thus, SAIH supports informal education and training in order to ensure increased political and critical participation among the target group

The main target group for SAIH's education for development is students and young people between the age of 15 and 35. A secondary target group outside this age-span is educational personnel and other academics related to the educational sector. Within these target groups women and girls are prioritised. In Latin America, indigenous peoples are also prioritised together with other marginalised and stigmatised groups that experience hindrances to genuine participation, such as lesbians, homosexuals, bisexuals and the transgendered, people living with HIV/AIDS, people with disabilities and other ethnic minorities.

Founded in 1961 and administered by elected representatives based at a secretariat in Oslo, SAIH has extensive experience with development cooperation and solidarity work aimed at these goals. Supported by member donations and direct support from ten local chapters and the Norwegian government's international development administration (Norad), SAIH has from its inception been involved in a range of literacy and education programmes and political solidarity campaigns aimed at protesting and preventing injustices in Africa and Latin America. SAIH presently has projects in five countries – Bolivia, Nicaragua, South Africa, Zambia and Zimbabwe - and has a network of

approximately 12 local groups at Norwegian Universities and Colleges. Up until 1997 SAIH sent Norwegian health personnel to Zimbabwe and Nicaragua and worked with health as well as education. From the 1990s until today SAIH has increasingly directed its development work towards education for development. SAIH has also extensive experience in direct cooperation with partners in the South and various triangle cooperations, which in addition to SAIH involves other Norwegian organisations and/or institutions.

### 2.3 SAIH's Assistance to Bolivia

SAIH's assistance to Bolivia stretches back to the start of the 1960s. In cooperation with UNESCO and the International University Exchange Fund (IEUF) a pilot project was started in 1961 aimed at lowering the country's then 80% illiteracy rate. From 1963 until the end of the 1970s Bolivia and Latin America were not included in SAIH international activities. Renewed interest in the country started in 1978 with the establishment together with Danish World University Service (WUS) International of a project aimed at giving assistance to the widows of miners in the Catavi province of Bolivia. The project proved to be difficult for SAIH as a result of the economic crisis that hit the national mining company and surrounding communities in the course of the 1980s. The project had been aimed at making improvements to seven small textile factories and to assist the women in technical training and establishing their own workers organisation. In 1992 new arrangements for cooperation were made with the Centre for Integrated Development for Aymara Women (Centro de Desarrollo Integral de la Mujer Aymara (CDIMA), an organisation run by Aymara women for Aymara women. At the same time SAIH with the Rainforest Fund (Regnskogsfondet), Development Fund (Uviklingsfondet) and Norwegian Peoples Aid (Norskfolkjelp) for the award of Operasjons Dagsverk<sup>2</sup> (OD) funds towards a project "Indian education on their own grounds" (Indiansk utdanning på egne premisser). The project aimed to provide indigenous communities in Bolivia, Ecuador, Brazil and Costa Rica education and training that would contribute to an increase in self respect and knowledge of their own rights. The funds furthermore established indigenous education with an emphasis on their own languages and tradition, as well as education for necessary skills to take part in contemporary society and defend their cultural rights. Following these achievements the indigenous communities in Bolivia have remained a main target group and support continues to be given towards political organisation as well as formal and informal education<sup>3</sup>.

### 2.4 The Sense of a Special Focus: Indigenous Peoples in Bolivia

Further justification for the targeting of indigenous peoples and rights in Bolivia has also been based by SAIH on the particular historical and socio-economic conditions of the indigenous segment of the population in Bolivia. Although the 32 different indigenous populations in Bolivia make up a total of c63% of the total population in the country (National Census Date INE 2006) their numeric dominance has not until very recently guaranteed indigenous communities any equality of political, economic, social and cultural rights in the country. Indeed, ruled for generations by a small white *criollo* (Bolivia born) elite, the majority indigenous in the country have long endured violent oppression of their rights-especially to land and culture- and severe conditions of economic marginalisation. Between 1999 and 2002 poverty rose in Bolivia from 62% to 65%, and in some rural areas in the Highlands of the country is estimated to be as high as 82% (Landa 2002; Hernani 2002). There is furthermore a large gap in the distribution of wealth. The richest 20% controls half of the total wealth and a third of the indigenous population live below the two USD poverty line (Hall & Patrinos, 2006). The introduction of Structural Adjustment and the

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.od.no/>

<sup>3</sup> SAIH defines informal education as education taking place outside the formal educational system such as postgraduate college and university. Be it courses, seminars or other activities with a specific training and educational objective.

large scale lay-offs from the mines and other closed or privatised industries in the 1980s, have also forced many people to leave their rural communities in search of work in the cities. This effort has also most often been without success (there is currently c12% unemployment in Bolivia, with more than 60% working in the informal sector).

It also important to add to this background by recognising that over the last twenty years indigenous communities and organisations have been attempting to respond to these conditions and politics of poverty through processes aimed at strengthening identity and the formalisation of rights. They have been helped to some extent in these efforts by the introduction of internationally supported conventions for human and indigenous rights, the introduction of rights based development and a series of multi-cultural and constitutional reforms in the region of Latin America. Key events such as the marking of 500 years of resistance in 1992 and the following mass mobilisation and marches for “Land and Dignity” forced city populations in Bolivia to recognise the existence and continuing coherence of indigenous identities. In 1993 Victor Hugo Cárdenas was voted into the Vice-Presidency of the country, after an alliance was formed between his minority indigenous party (MRTKL) and the then traditionally powerful party of the national revolution (MNR). As well as symbolic of an opening up of political participation to indigenous peoples in the country, Cárdenas was also the co-architect of a series of reforms such as the Law of Popular Participation and Bilingual Education, that whilst controversial and with uneven impacts across the country recognised the important contribution of the indigenous population to the identity and governance of the country. Further description and discussion of recent political events concerning indigenous peoples can be found in relevant later sections of this evaluation.

## 2.5 Current Work in Bolivia

The work started with OD funds in the 1990s is now supported by a framework agreement with Norad. Over the last three years (2006-8) SAIH have received 17.5 million NOK per year towards its international projects from Norad, of which a little over 5 million per year has been channelled to its work in Bolivia<sup>4</sup>.

Continuing work includes projects in partnership with CDIMA aimed at awareness rising and training of Aymara youth and women in the countryside and to strengthen traditional local Indian organizations influence in local governance. CDIMA also provide counselling to local organizations and arrange seminars, courses, and workshops for local Aymara youth and women. SAIH also supports the Centre for Study and Assistance to Local Development (Centro de Estudios y Apoyo al Desarrollo Local -CEADL) on several projects. This includes recently contracted “civil society observation” financed by Norad’s “Oil for Development” Programme. Apart from these projects, and of more importance to the focus of this evaluation, SAIH’s work in Bolivia has also become formalised through the development of five partnership initiatives organised with local communities and the Catholic University in La Paz under the banner of Peasant Academic Units (Unidades Académicas Campesinas).

## 2.6 Unidades Académicas Campesinas (UACs)

The Peasant Academic Units (UACs) have been strategically located in the communities of Batallas, Escoma, Pucarani and Tiahuanaco, all indigenous communities in the Highland Department of La Paz and close to Lake Titicaca. They have been organised as autonomous higher education establishments organised below the auspices of the Bolivian Catholic University of San Pablo in country’s capital, La Paz. They function legally according to national law (No 1545 of 21<sup>st</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup> See Annex 2.

May 1994) and an agreement underwritten by the Bishop of the Parish of El Alto and the Catholic University. The UACs were created by the Catholic Church of Bolivia with the aim of reducing the social injustices experienced by the indigenous population of Bolivia throughout its Republican and Colonial history. In the 1970s and 1980s the life of many populations living in the Highlands of the country was made increasingly unstable as a result of a series of natural disasters including drought, flood and resulting high levels of migration to the cities of Bolivia and elsewhere in South America.

Worried about these processes of migration, the arrival of new agricultural technologies, poor living conditions and the largely absent development assistance of the state, municipal leaders in the rural started to promote strategies to overcome their communities difficulties. They promoted the idea of starting a process of professional development aimed at young people in this part of the country. This idea was granted support by a number of Catholic parishes in the Department of La Paz. Assistance was furthermore given by the Catholic Church in the buying of land and the physical construction of higher education facilities. The Church also supported the idea that the UACs could make a significant impact on fundamental problems of discrimination and social development in the region.

The UACs in Batallas, Pucarani and Tiahuanaco were founded in 1986 and in 1995 the Catholic University of La Paz incorporated them into the institutional structure of the Institute for Rural Development (IDR). As such, these UACs became a part of the University's official relations with the rural area and formal responsibility was established for their academic supervision and quality assurance<sup>5</sup>. In contrast to the others, the UAC in Escoma is established as a "Normal" i.e. a state recognised teaching academy under the academic rubric of the Catholic University in Cochabamba where this academic specialisation is based in Bolivia. As such, the administration and academic supervision of UAC Escoma is organised under the immediate direction of the Advanced Catholic Institute (Instituto Normal Superior Católico "Sedes Sapientiae" (INSCSS).

## UAC Batallas

The Unidad Académica Campesina in Batallas was founded in 1987 based on two academic disciplines i.e. Agro-industry and Veterinary Medicine. It was founded on the basis of responding to local demand for the technical formation of young people in the rural area and as a means to address problems of rural poverty and out-migration to the cities.

The cooperation between SAIH and UAC Batallas started in 1999. The current project called "Proyecto Medicina Veterinaria y Zootecnia" is aimed at developing the professional basis of veterinary medicine and animal husbandry in the context of the Bolivian altiplano region, respecting the local eco-system and regional culture. This has been done by raising the level of the teaching from that of *Técnico Superior* to an internationally recognised *licenciatura* (equivalent to a European Bachelors degree). The creation of this higher qualification means that students can remain and complete their studies in the context of the rural area. The teaching of these subjects has also been improved through construction of a modern infrastructure (including offices, a lecture hall, classes, laboratories and student residence) and the provision of needed materials and equipment.

Students at the UAC Batallas receive training in their own social and cultural context, including a semester on Anthropology. Students have the option of writing their thesis in their indigenous mother tongue (Aymara, Quechua, Guaraní). Both male and female students have been educated to

---

<sup>5</sup> The Catholic Church currently manages c30% of the education in the country i.e. more than 570 centers of technical formation, and more than 3000 schools. The UCB and the Universidad Salesiana together have a student population of more than 25,000.

assist in family farming and in the provision of veterinary medicine in their home areas, in some cases through the establishment of their own small businesses.

UAC Batallas now has c250 students inscribed in its two degrees; of which c60 reside in the student residence built on campus. The students inscribed in these courses are not only drawn from the Department of La Paz, but come from rural areas elsewhere in the Highlands and Lowlands of the country. A large percentage of the students (c50%) come from the urban neighbourhoods of El Alto. El Alto is a migrant city with an urban population that is closely linked to rural communities in the surrounding area. There has been some contact with the local municipal government who have also provided a few small student grants.

UAC Batallas runs a small practice farm that as well as providing training produces a series of meat, dairy and vegetable products. As well as feeding their students, these products are also sold in the local area.

A number of student grants supporting matriculation costs and living expenses are offered by the UAC. These grants are financed by SAIH financing, the Catholic University in La Paz and other donations by organisations and individuals. In recent years considerable funding for infrastructural development at UAC Batallas has been also been granted by USAID, JICA and the Danish Embassy.

## UAC Escoma

UAC Escoma is a state approved teacher training academy (normal) that mainly specialises in the formation and training of bilingual teachers. More minimal efforts have also been made to develop the local study of agronomy. A total of 355 students have been registered for study at UAC Escoma since its recognition as a *normal*, of which 195 remain in study. As a result of changes in the education system UAC Escoma has been instructed to not take in any new students in 2008. UAC Escoma is the only centre for pedagogy in the northern district of La Paz and as such draws students from a large and culturally diverse territory. The cooperation between UAC Escoma and SAIH started in 2003. As part of its cooperation agreement SAIH is contributing financially to the implementation and improvement of infrastructure, equipment and training. As well as classrooms, offices, a sports hall and canteen, a small student residence has been built. A total of 18 female and male students currently use this residence. Following a long campaign of improvement and recognition following its foundation in 1994, UAC Escoma has raised its teaching level from that of “tecnico superior” to “licenciatura”, or bachelor’s level. The current project established between SAIH and UAC Escoma called “Formación de docentes en educación intercultural bilingüe (EIB) (2006-2008)” is aimed at strengthening the infrastructure, equipment and training of teachers. Founded on the basis of Inter-cultural bilingual education (EIB), UAC Escoma aims to respond to the need to strengthen the language and culture of the local indigenous peoples and improve the quality of teaching in the education system.

The introduction of Inter-cultural bilingual education (EIB) was given official acceptance in Bolivia following the introduction of an Education reform in 1994 (Law 1565). Article 1 of the law established that Bolivian education “is intercultural and bilingual” and in article 6 the law defines the Educational Councils of Indigenous Peoples (CEPOs) as the mechanisms for popular participation in education. As a result of this law official acceptance was granted to the idea of inter-cultural communication in education i.e. the valorisation and approval of the rich cultural and linguistic diversity in the country. Despite this official recognition of EIB, throughout the 1990s opposition by urban teachers unions and resistance by local communities to the idea of Spanish being replaced by indigenous languages in schools meant that it did not take hold in general

educational practice. In only a few special instances, such as UAC Escoma, has EIB been given full-hearted support as the basis for national education.

In UAC Escoma the application of EIB has been developed through the direct valorisation of local indigenous cultural identity and the process of alphabetisation in Aymara and Quechua. Whilst many of the students speak Spanish and/or Aymara/Quechua knowledge of these languages is often partial and incorrect. Students also have problems in writing and reading to sufficient levels in these languages. Aware of the difficulties of favouring one language over another, the teachers of UAC Escoma have devised a system to raise students' knowledge of both their native language and of Spanish. Emphasis is given to where the students' knowledge is weakest. Students are introduced in their courses to the methodology and thinking behind EIB. This teaching in languages and theory is supported through a series of training workshops in pedagogy and the creation of didactic materials. Further teaching practice in these methods and thinking are developed through the creation of *pilotos nucleos*, i.e. an agreement has been made with three village schools so that apprentice teachers learn to utilise their skills on the job. As well as three different training locations in the district of Camacho, teaching links have also been formed with neighbouring schools in Escoma, such as the Don Bosco primary school and CEMA adult education centre. A small number of bachelor level theses written in Aymara have now been produced by students of the UAC.

Although there have been difficulties in forming strong links with the local government as a result of a series of corruption charges within the local *alcaldia*, a number of efforts have been made to extend knowledge and service to the local community. The students regularly hold workshops and seminars in Aymara in the surrounding villages, some of which are mining communities, on a series of topics also included in their teacher training i.e. gender equality, democracy, sexuality (including contraception), health, and environmentalism. UAC Escoma also runs a local Aymara speaking radio station, together with the local Catholic parish, where students are invited to hold regular programmes on the topics of their study. The sports hall at the UAC is regularly used by the local ancestral leaders and community for different meetings.

## UAC Tiahuanaco

Tiahuanaco is the longest functioning of the four UACs included in this evaluation. UAC Tiahuanaco was founded on 4 hectares of land in 1986 as an offshoot of the *Centro de Educación Media de Adultos* "CEMA", and gained formal recognition as a higher education establishment with "technical superior" level training in 1987. The following are listed as the reasons for its formation:

- A response to discrimination (racial, social, economic, language and dress)
- A means to stop the exodus of young people to the cities
- The low levels of young people continuing into higher education because of lack of access and resources.
- The demand of the local indigenous and municipal leaders for the establishment of a local institution for "culturally sensitive" education.

UAC Tiahuanaco has been supported by SAIH since 1993. UAC Tiahuanaco was able to offer its first bachelor degree in 1996 under the auspices of the Catholic University in La Paz. The current "Tri-annual Management Project 2006-2008 Tiahuanaco" established between the UAC and SAIH continues with the process of development started in 1993 and aims to provide quality higher education in agronomy and animal husbandry. In the first phase the aim was to improve the quality of education, infrastructure (including a laboratory and library) promotion of student leadership and development of the social links between the university and the local community. In the second phase the cooperation with SAIH contributes to the creation and function of bachelors degrees in Agricultural Engineering (plant, water and soil sciences) and Animal Husbandry Sciences

(*Licenciatura en Ingeniería Agronómica e Ingeniería Zootécnica*), through the expansion and improvement of administrative structures. Both of these degrees have been developed in close relation to the particularities of the local environment. There are currently c175 students enrolled in these courses, of which 90% come from the local rural area. These bachelors degree course are now taught in addition to the earlier “technical superior” courses. Extension of lower level “tecnico medio” courses has been made widespread through the formation and capacitation of small practice groups “perritos” throughout the Northern (as far as Achacachi) and Southern altiplano (As far as Northern Potosí) area. In recent years there has been an increasing demand from local municipalities, NGOs and producers associations for the training services provided by UAC Tiahuanaco. Indeed, a large proportion of the local municipal staff has been trained by the UAC.

As well as producing food for its own students, UAC Tiahuanaco runs a practice farm from which a range of meat, dairy and vegetable products are produced and sold in the local area and nearby capital city.

In addition to Agricultural Engineering and Animal Husbandry Sciences the UAC Tiahuanaco has also recently established (2006) bachelors training in Tourism. Located close by to a large pre-Incan archaeological site, now recognised as a UNESCO protected heritage site, as well as Lake Titicaca, UAC Tiahuanaco is well placed to train and service the steady levels of tourism in the local area. There are now a 110 students (female and male) taking this course.

## UAC Pucarani

UAC Pucarani was established in 1986 on the basis of introducing context appropriate nursing training into the rural area of La Paz. With funding from a Danish NGO a project was established to create a local hospital and ten health posts throughout the province of Los Andes. Academic work at the UAC started in 1987 and in 1989 formal acknowledgement and accreditation was granted to the entity by the Catholic University in La Paz. In 1998 UAC Pucarani entered into a cooperation agreement with SAIH.

The current project between UAC Pucarani and SAIH “Institutional Strengthening UAC Pucarani” (2006-2008) aims to further strengthen the quality of nursing training in the countryside. A Bachelors certification in Nursing was created in 1999 and since then the projects have continued to strengthen the infrastructure, equipment and academic quality of the course. A total of 502 students are currently matriculated in the nursing course (of which 41 are men). A total of 4 bachelors thesis have so far been completed. A scientific journal “Fiat Lux” has been established by the UAC as a means to publish research findings and further establish the higher academic level of their degree.

The UAC now contains a clinic, administrative offices, a series of classrooms equipped for the training of all aspects of basic nursing, student dormitories, a small food kiosk, a computer room and library. A small radio station, Radio Chaky Cultural, is also located on site and provides basic health education to the local area amongst other news.

All of the students of the nursing degree at UAC Pucarani are expected to conduct 9 months of practice in a local hospital or health post (rotating between children, grown people, pregnant women and public health). A formal agreement has been created with the Ministry of Health allowing for the placement of Pucarani’s students in many of the state hospitals in the capital city and other rural districts. Individual arrangements with other organisations and NGOs also ensure that students are able to find further placement locations for their practice periods.

A small farm, run with the help of staff hired from UAC Tiahuanaco, provides UAC Pucarani's students with food. A small amount of the meat, dairy and vegetable products are also sold to the local markets.

#### Project for the Inter-Institutional Development of the UACS (Inter-UAC)

A project funded by SAIH aimed at inter-institutional work and now coordinated between the UACs was started in 2005. The "Project for Inter-institutional development UACs Batallas, Escoma, Pucarani, Tiahuanaco" aims to achieve the international accreditation of the UACs as higher education establishments within the MERCOSUR region. The project is now in its final year.



### 3. Criteria for Evaluation

Responding to the questions and concerns specified in the Terms of Reference the following three separate points are defined as our operational criteria for the evaluation process. In the section of analysis and conclusions that follows these operational criteria are applied in both a general and specific form, allowing for general comments to be made about the UACs as a collective whole and for specific comments to be made about the work of each individual unit. An effort is also made to balance positive and negative comments relating to each of these criteria.

#### 3.1 Strengthened as Higher Education Institutions Working with Indigenous Peoples?

Our understanding here of respect of local indigenous culture is founded on recognition of the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs guidelines for promoting the rights of indigenous peoples. These are guidelines that are in turn founded on the clear reference and adoption of the International Labour Organisation (ILO) Convention 169. A 1989 revision of earlier Convention 107/69, the Conventions attempts to legally specify the identity and international recognised rights of indigenous peoples. Article 1 of ILO 169 defines indigenous peoples as:

- a) tribal peoples in independent countries whose social, cultural and economic conditions distinguish them from other sections of the national community, and whose status is regulated wholly or partially by their own customs or traditions or by special laws and regulations.
- b) peoples in independent countries who are regarded as indigenous on account of their descent from the populations which inhabited the country, or a geographical region to which the country belongs, at the time of the conquest or colonisation or the establishment of present state boundaries and who, irrespective of their legal status, retain some or all of their own social, economic, cultural and political institutions.
- c) Self-identification as indigenous or tribal shall be regarded as fundamental criterion for determining the groups to which the provisions of this Convention apply.

According to ILO 169 indigenous peoples have the rights to maintain and develop their own culture and language. The Convention contains provisions concerning the right to natural resources, traditional lands and territories etc. The Convention also states that indigenous people have the right to “prior consultation” i.e. to be consulted and to take part in decision-making processes relating to issue that concern them. It furthermore states that government authorities ratifying the convention have an obligation to support this work.

Developed from a basis in ILO 169, the Norwegian human-rights based guidelines for support of indigenous peoples aim to highlight that development and human rights are inextricably linked. The guidelines state that they aim to break the circle connecting poverty and an absence of choice and opportunity by ensuring that the rights of individuals or groups living in marginalisation, and specifically indigenous peoples, who are often the poorest of the poor, are fulfilled. Simply put human rights norms provide the basis for development and contain the norms to which committed States must conform and the rights that individuals can demand. The guidelines state that key concepts of its human-rights based approach are the responsibility of the State, the empowerment and participation of individuals/groups, no-discrimination of individuals and focus on vulnerable groups.

As a means to distinguish the extent to which a specific project supported by the Norwegian government are primarily human-rights based or motivated by other consideration the guidelines distinguish between two specific categories: *specific support for indigenous peoples* and *integrated support for indigenous peoples*. According to the guidelines a project classified as *specific support for indigenous peoples* must:

- a) have clear, identifiable targets relating to the improvement of the target group's situation in defined areas of the project design, and
- b) involve the indigenous group(s) in the formulation of the goals of and methods used in the project or programme.

Other projects where indigenous peoples are the main, or subsidiary target group, but the project is not explicitly based on ILO 169 and the traditional culture and way of life of indigenous peoples in terms of project design and implementation, are described as *integrated support for indigenous peoples*.

The Norwegian guidelines established in 2004 are an important advance in developing a solid, coherent and normatively founded approach for all of Norway's development cooperation with indigenous peoples and therefore of validity and importance to this evaluation. The principles they express are central to the demands presented by indigenous peoples, and they reflect the emerging international agreement on the rights of indigenous peoples, as expressed for instance by the recently approved UN Declaration. It is important for all organisations that submit to these criteria to note, however, that there remain issues in the Guidelines that logical create confusion and remain to be clarified. Most importantly, this relates to the distinction between *specific* and *integrated* support for indigenous peoples. In an earlier report we have highlighted (Borchgrevink & McNeish 2007) that this distinction is not always easy to draw in practice, and that it is difficult to make the currently defined criteria less ambiguous. What urgently needs to be clarified, however, is what status the Guidelines should have for the *integrated* support to indigenous peoples. As *integrated* support is defined as projects not explicitly based on ILO 169 and the traditional culture and way of life of the indigenous people, one might draw the conclusion that the Guidelines make no specific requirements on these projects. Some further specific requirements must therefore also be made on the *integrated* projects. This is also linked to the classification of projects as indigenous people's projects. This is done through the organizations' completion of the reporting formats codes for target groups, where indigenous peoples are one option. As the NUPI report *Norges bistand til urfolk* (Haslie & Overland 2007) showed, this is an area surrounded with considerable confusion among all types of development actors. It seems probable that the intention of the reporting system is that also *integrated* support is to be reported, but this remains unclear.

### 3.2 Working in line with SAIH's Education for Development Strategy?

In its thinking to support the idea of "education for development" SAIH states that education is a human right and a means for obtaining liberation. Development cooperation alone does not result in liberation hence SAIH's work is a combination of education for development, information work and political advocacy.

The development projects supported by SAIH are conceived of as addressing the root causes preventing liberation i.e. not only towards treating the symptoms. The educational activities supported by SAIH promote development and sustainability, but also respect and further develop cultural knowledge thus contributing to an eventual goal of making development aid superfluous.

SAIH aims to ensure that all projects and programmes take into consideration national and local conditions in a respectful and professional way.

The most important criteria of support for SAIH is that educational activities support a wider development process that promotes awareness raising, identity, individual development and self-respect, language, solidarity, unity, participation, engagement and community spirit. When SAIH considers what activities to support, it is of crucial importance that the education offered is strategically directed towards a positive social change as well as of value for the individual participant.

As stated in their current policy document (ibid 2008) SAIH proposes to focus its education for development on (1) the educational sector in a country and (2) projects that use education and training as means to obtain liberation:

1. The educational sector in a country.

Education is a human right and SAIH wishes to strengthen the education sector. The formal education in a country is the responsibility of the public authorities. It is important to have a holistic and integrated perspective on the educational sector that includes all levels of education and all involved parties. Active participation from different participants within the civil society is important within the educational sector.

2. Education and training as a means to obtain liberation

Through informal education and training SAIH aims to contribute to liberation through strengthening the ability of individuals and groups to function as change agents in their societies. Different forms of participatory methods are important in this work. SAIH aims to raise awareness of and fight structural hindrances to real social and political participation in the target group.

A focus on women's participation and gender equity plays a particularly important part in realising this strategy, and is an element with which SAIH are interested to include in this current evaluation. SAIH recognises that there exist large structural differences between men and women in the countries of the South. Structures of power and oppressive cultural and social practises prevent women from participating in society on the same footing as men, and expose women to discrimination and violence. This is also valid for the educational sector. As a result, gender relations and women's rights are emphasized in all of SAIH's project work.

### 3.3 Role in the New Political Context?

In December 2005 Evo Morales Ayma, an Aymara indigenous union leader was elected to the Bolivian presidency. This event marked a dramatic change in the country's political history. Not only did it end a cycle of wide scale political protests focused on public participation in decisions regarding the sale and benefits of the country's rich natural resources (McNeish 2006), but symbolised a greater shift in which after 500 years of marginalisation the majority indigenous population gained control of the decision-making apparatus of the Bolivian state. Immediately following his election, the Movement for Socialism (MAS) government responded to popular demand and initiated a wide-scale process of political reform aimed at ending ethnic discrimination and at addressing the extreme poverty in the country. Although controversial in nature because of its socialist overtones and process of nationalisation, part of this process of reform included the radically democratic move of introducing a process of constitutional reform in which all sectors of the country would decide on the new identity and structure of the country's constitution and government.

Whilst the results of the Constitutional Assembly, published in the form of new proposal for a national constitution in December 2007, remain the focus of great social division and contestation in the country there is no doubt that the indigenous population have been given increased official recognition as part of the nation. Following on from this indigenous communities in the country have gained in their self-estimation as citizens and confidence in their rights to political participation. This has had ramifications for understanding all parts of social life in the country including education. The new constitution recognises and strengthens indigenous rights to culture, property and political participation and the right to education in their own language. Furthermore, the recent proposals for education reform, “Anteproyecto de Ley de la Educación Boliviana: Avelino Siñani y Elizardo Pérez”, explicitly states the aim of creating a decolonialised and pluri-cultural system of education. When approved this new system is likely to have significant ramifications for the UACs. In the proposed reform Article 4 of the General Dispositions of the Law states that “all private education will fall under the norms and permanent control of the state”. Under Article 15 a of the section of the proposed Law on Socio-cultural and Linguistic Diversity it states that language teaching will consist of “native language as first language (L1) and Spanish as second language (L2) in both mono-lingual populations and communities where indigenous (originario) languages predominate. In Article 16 b of the Section on Development of Intra and inter- culturality the proposed law further states the aim of creating a “symmetric relation of knowledges, science and technology appropriate to their context, that strengthens individual identity and equal conditions of interaction between indigenous and western cultures”.

There are then a set of possible new conditions in which the UACs must now operate and adjust to. Indeed, these are conditions that both challenge and encourage the work of the UACs. Recognising this, another of the criteria under which this evaluation operates is therefore to consider the content and impact of these new conditions in relation to the work of the UACs. Indeed, given the particular nature of the UACs as institutions for higher education where the main target group is the country’s rural indigenous community and where the goal is to produce the basis for cultural sensitive education and empowerment, the evaluation also considers whether the UACs might have new roles to play as players and models in a reconfigured system of education. In attempting to consider both the impact of political changes and the possible role of the UACs in the new political context, recognition must also be made of the threats to governmental stability in the country. As suggested above, the reforms made by the Morales government remain highly controversial both within and outwith the country. More specifically, sectors of the old white elite, far right and business community centred in the Lowland departments of Santa Cruz, Chuquisaca, Pando, Beni and Tarija oppose the changes as a threat to their political, economic and cultural control. In an effort to regain political and economic control sections of these department population have now organised a militant campaign to oppose the constitutional reforms and to push for separatist autonomy. Further disquiet in the country has also been created recently as a result of a combination of difficulties for the country’s largely poor and agrarian population, including climate change, rising food prices and the weak presence in satellite and rural communities of the forces of law and order. Together these campaigns and difficulties have generated a series of, so far sporadic, protests and violent confrontations that rob the government of both attention and room for manoeuvre in addressing other productive issues and the conclusion of further reforms.

## 4. Analysis and Conclusions

### 4.1 Strengthened as Higher Education Institutions Working with Indigenous Peoples?

In all of the interviews conducted with the local staff, students and representatives of the community there was explicit mention of the pride and respect of the UACs work for the local Aymara community and culture. Whilst in other areas of Bolivia, and particularly urban and peri-urban neighbourhoods, there is often confusion and a lack of clarity to ethnic membership this did not appear to be the case in any of the UAC communities visited. Indeed, it was evident that whilst more reflection on the cultural content of teaching could be made there was conscious reflection on the value of the education being provided by the UACs to local indigenous peoples economic, political and cultural rights. The stated specific aim of all the UACs was in foundation to provide culturally sensitive and contextually appropriate education aimed at local Aymaran youth. This is evidently backed up in teaching practice and content. Repeated mention was made in our interviews of the desire to address the problem of out-migration and to create an opportunity for higher education that was accessible to the local indigenous population. Whilst in some of the locations students were drawn from other areas of the country, the number and origins of the students at each of the UACs bore out the claim that the majority of the students had their origins in the rural indigenous communities (mostly Aymara, some Quechua and a few Guarani and others). These students were proud of their indigenous identity and thankful for the opportunity to be able to express their cultural identity whilst studying. Added to this repeated discussion was made of the explicit desire of the UACs to create the conditions for education in which it was possible for local indigenous young people to learn and use their own language and forms of expression, including their form of traditional dress<sup>6</sup>. Pride was also taken in the cultural content of teaching. Although each of the professional course offered by the UACs aims to introduce and train students to modern techniques and methods, recognition was also made in each location of the need for flexibility, respect and the integration of cultural/local knowledge in their operation and development. Whilst the strength of relationships between the UACs and local municipal and ancestral authorities differed from location to location and could be improved in some cases all of the UACs recognised the need to respect these leaders and the importance of grounding their work through these political relationships. The support given by SAIH to each of the UACs was also recognised as having played a vital part in creating sufficient flexibility and the conditions for these culturally sensitive perspectives to be realised in practice. On the basis of these findings it can in general be concluded that SAIH support to the UACs has strengthened them as higher education institutions working with indigenous peoples. Indeed, given the UACs clear targets of cultural sensitivity and practical impact on local indigenous peoples means of empowerment, coupled with local community involvement, it can be concluded that the UACs are working in line with Norad's guidelines for *specific support for indigenous peoples*. It is worth noting that a positive evaluation of SAIH's work with indigenous peoples as part of civil society also appears to be supported by the conclusion of NIBR's recent "State of the Art Study: Development Cooperation through Norwegian NGOs in South America" (NIBR 2007).

Although concluding that the UACs are working in line with Norad's guidelines for *specific support to indigenous peoples* it should nonetheless be stressed that in each of the locations more work could be done to reflect and possibly form a more explicit strategy for the strengthening of indigenous rights. Further emphasis could be made by all the UACs in the teaching of what indigenous rights

---

<sup>6</sup> This is particularly relevant in the case of female students who more regularly than men use traditional styles of clothing and physical expression, such as the pollera (a multi-layered skirt) and long braids.

are and how they are understood at the international as well as national levels. In order to be of use as legal protections inconsistencies between indigenous rights and other rights discourses need to be sorted out and given sense at the local level. In some cases the teaching of the UACs is influenced by Catholic religious doctrine, morality and values. Although there is clearly a considerable acceptance of Catholic doctrine, morality and values at the level of the student and local community this should really not be taken as a given. Free discussion needs to be made of these ideas and their origins made clearer so that a more practical understanding of their value, significance and mobilisation can be established. This would be of particular value given the currently confused and divisive cultural politics evidently at work at all levels of contemporary Bolivian society. More effort needs also to be made to not only extend knowledge, services and products into the local community, but in the formation of relationships with the local community. Although difficult in some instances because of internal conflicts within municipal governments, there is still a large potential for the UACs to improve their contacts with local political and cultural leaders. Some efforts are now being made to visit rural communities and to discuss the teaching content of the UACs with local people. This work should be expanded where possible. Indeed, the decision-making structures of the UACs, including the design of courses, degrees and reading lists, should involve elected representatives (municipal/ancestral) from the local communities. If conducted in an open manner, these mechanisms will ensure the participatory and prior-consultation aims of existing indigenous rights thinking.

### UAC Batallas

The work of this unit is of clear significance to the economy and knowledge of the local community, as well as the more widespread indigenous communities from which it draws its students. Focused on the teaching of Agro-industry and Veterinary Medicine a clear contribution is being made by the UAC to the principal economic activities of the region, and therefore the stability of the local indigenous population. Opportunity is given to the students of the UAC to utilise their own language and cultural practices. Some instruction (a semester) is also provided in local anthropology, and concerted efforts made to fit and further develop local environmental knowledge and practices within the standard teaching of the UACs two disciplines.

The Director of the UAC Batallas is new to Bolivia and perhaps as a result of this the impression gained by the main evaluator is that more time needs to be taken to learn and develop a deeper sensitivity to the logics and function of local culture and community organisation. Whilst the representative of the municipal government we interviewed had a high opinion of the UAC and its value to the community (as well as many suggestions for its further improvement), the signals given by the director of the UAC were that this admiration was not mutual. Despite the advantages that such anchorage might bring in terms of long term sustainability and support, there was a marked scepticism on the part of the UAC leadership to the idea of strengthening links with local government. No real basis was given for this impression other than an evident need to become better acquainted with the workings and interests of the local government. This can be done without threat to the unit's educational autonomy.

### UAC Escoma

In its use and promotion of inter-cultural bilingual education (EIB) UAC Escoma is clearly advanced in its thinking about how best to integrate national teaching curriculum with a respect for local indigenous culture and language. Connection with SAIH's cooperation work in Nicaragua has also clearly had a positive impact on its leaderships thinking about its indigenous focus. Clear efforts are being taken by UAC Escoma to encourage the use of Aymara/Quechua in the classroom, practice periods and thesis writing. Further encouragement of local language and culture is also evident in the creation use of didactic materials. Although it has been difficult to form a strong

connection with the local municipal government (currently embroiled in internal corruption allegations), a strong bond has been formed with the local communities where they work. The buildings and grounds of the UAC are also regularly used by the local people, including ancestral leaders, for community and political meetings.

Although admirable for its emphasis on EIB, further improvement to its sensitivity to local culture and knowledge could be made. Whilst its didactic material attempts to convey a respect for local culture and language, the vast majority of the symbols and images used to convey these messages are taken from Bolivian national or Western society. More focus should be given to local cultural symbols and ideas. Indeed, local Aymara cosmology and religious beliefs should also be considered as valid sources of inspiration and learning. Even although there is an emphasis on cultural sensitivity there is a clear tendency, and perhaps shared by all the UACs, to emphasise Catholic and modern national ideas over those of the local culture. Rather than the result of alternative development emphasised by EIB, the result of this stress results in the impression of a failure to replace earlier models for education aimed at modernisation along Western lines of national development.

### UAC Tiahuanaco

Of all the UACs, Tiahuanaco has the closest relationship with the local community and local culture. Some explanation for this can be derived from the longevity of the UACs functioning in the local area and the Director's unusual role as both priest and ancestral leader (*mallku*) in the community. Acknowledgement must, however, also be made of the concerted effort made by the leadership, teachers and students of the UAC in general to contribute to the well-being and cultural rejuvenation of the local community. Traditional environmental knowledge and agricultural techniques such as raised fields (*suka kollus*) and plant varieties are encouraged in the teaching of the UAC. The local *alcaldesa* (mayoress) and *mallku cantonal* (ancestral leader) spoke highly of their contact with the UAC and its value to the development and identity of the local community. The degree courses and extension of basic training into distant rural areas were clearly seen as means to generate economic stability and improvement as well as necessary educational mechanisms to secure cultural and political rights. Again, students are encouraged where able to use their indigenous mother tongue in their studies. The education of local tourist guides was also seen as a way of ensuring economic and cultural development. It is worth noting that a large number of the municipal staff in Tiahuanaco have been educated at the UAC.

Although clearly engaged in many activities that are of value to the economic and cultural development of Tiahuanaco, further work could be done to improve student and local understandings of indigenous rights. It is all too easy for UAC teachers to dismiss the teaching of rights as a subject in its self, by stressing the technical nature of their degree courses. More emphasis needs to be given to the social nature of both knowledge and technology, and this should include a focused education on the nature and value of rights.

### UAC Pucarani

As well as a deep concern with academic quality there is a clear respect for local culture and a desire to contribute to the well-being of local indigenous society in the work of UAC Pucarani. The staff and teachers of the UAC are clearly proud of the contribution that their students are making to the public health of rural areas, and of the specialised knowledge many of them carry with them. Care is taken in the training of nurses to instil knowledge of western medical techniques parallel to a respect and enquiry into local and traditional medicinal practices and substances. As part of this work research is being conducted into the preparation, use and sale of traditional medicines. This combined knowledge is thought to create an advantage over urban taught nursing students who lack

the cultural intimacy and understanding of the UAC students. Although many of the UAC's students conduct the practice periods in the hospitals of La Paz, the vast majority of completed students work in the rural area. In addition to its teaching practices the UAC also runs a small Aymara radio station that is an important source of health information, news and cultural programming in the local area.

Although keen to demonstrate the strength of their local commitment and contact to the local community, it was clear from both the selection of interview subjects, and the responses of the local leaders from the municipal section of Corapata that improvements could be made in these relationships. Indeed, during the interview the UAC was accused of not visiting Corapata frequently enough. Of all the UACs, it was also evident that Pucarani was the location where an emphasis on "moral" education was at its strongest. This may be the result of the newness of the UAC's priest director and/or closeness to the diocese offices in El Alto. Again, we think it necessary for the UAC to rethink this part of the education and to give more emphasis to the secular education of human and indigenous rights. Students should be encouraged to take part in open reflection on the source and meaning of moral ideas including rights, and to reflect on the tensions that exist between these ideas and local cultural beliefs and practices.

### Project for the Inter-Institutional Development of the UACS (Inter-UAC)

To date the focus of this inter-UAC project has been on accreditation processes. As far as we are aware no explicit effort has been made to discuss the significance of the UACs as projects specifically aimed at the local indigenous populations. Formalised reflection on this particular point would add to and strengthen both internal and external consciousness of the real breadth of the UACs profile and identity as education/development project/s.

## 4.2 Working in line with SAIH's Education for Development Strategy?

The UACs fulfil their role not only as institutions for higher education, but as long-term projects that address serious problems of development and poverty in the rural area of Bolivia. These problems include high indices of out-migration, low levels of education, high levels of economic marginalisation and the historic discrimination of the rural indigenous population. Although these problems endure, the UACs have had some limited success in addressing and reducing each of these problems within their local areas. There are many evidences that SAIH's initial goal of cooperating to establish education and training that contributes to an increase in self respect and knowledge of their own rights has been achieved. The UACs offer an environment for education where indigenous language and background are given positive value, if not advantageous character. Besides and beyond the training and education provided to primarily indigenous young people, the UACs have also solidly extended their development impact into the surrounding communities of the Northern altiplano. As a result of student practice, offers of free workshops and training, product/skills testing and the provision of different services including primary teaching veterinary care, medical and agricultural advice a positive spin off on the levels of local development has occurred. Although difficult to quantify exactly within the limits of this evaluation, qualitative examples of rising education levels, milk and crop yields, health levels and income generation suggest that the adage of "education for development" is a valid and applicable description of the work of the UACs. At the local level at least the UACs alternative approaches to education appear on the basis of our evaluation to be fulfilling the desired liberational goal of acting as "agents of change".

The evaluation does, however, note a number of issues that limit the development impact of the UACs:



1. At present the directors of each of the UACs are appointed by the Catholic Church. This reflects the UACs history of establishment and the ownership of the land on which the UACs are built. Led by priests, it also means that the UACs are not led by suitably educated or specialised directors. Indeed, as priests the majority of the UAC directors have numerous other religious and pastoral obligations in the local community. At a time when the UACs need to think about future stability this lack of expertise and focus limits the vision and planning of the directors.
2. The UACs remain under the control and supervision of the Catholic Church and the Catholic University in La Paz (UCB). The UACs receive accreditation and prestige from this relationship, as well as some funding for land purchases and teachers' salaries. However, whilst aware of these advantages we question whether this relationship will really be the best arrangement in the long run. Although an internal legal process has been started within UCB to secure for the UACs full status as university institutions, neither the Catholic Church or UCB are willing to give any indication of an increase in funding. According to a recent comment in evaluation made by an audit company UCB has had no intention to support UACs because "*it is a father that does not want take care of his children*". This leaving the UACs entirely dependent on external funding (to date largely dependent on SAIH's support. Whilst prestige and accreditation are important, we observe that it is also responsible for creating problematic social divisions. Some people in the rural area see the link between the UACs and an elite university in the city as threatening and questionable. It has been suggested by some teachers and external political actors that the link with UCB should be severed, and the UACs established a unified indigenous university. The University of Uraccan in Nicaragua may be a valid model in this case. Within UCB there are also expressions of prejudice towards what are seen as "second class" rural annexes of the university. The connection also produces mis-understanding at the national level. The Ministry of Education simply views the UACs as part of the Catholic University without recognising their intended administrative autonomy.
3. Concerned with the prestige of UCB there is a general tendency on the part of the UAC directors, teachers and the UACs La Paz directorate to focus more on improving academic quality than the aspect of social extension/development. The rationale used is that higher academic quality will lead to better opportunities for funding. Although this assumption might be correct, it is also evident that in its exclusivity this focus will reduce the value of the UACs as "actors for change" in the local community and region. A balance needs to be struck between the search for academic quality and the extension of assistance and service to the community.
4. In their search for academic improvement there is also a general tendency amongst the UACs to recognise, but limit the participation of the local government and community in decision making. Some efforts have been made a local consultation, but participation has by in large been limited to external dialogue. It has been suggested that in the future a new General Governing Board be created to improve the interaction and administration of all the UACS. In this suggestion mention has been made of the importance to include experts (pedagogic, academic and administrative) in this Governing Board. So far no real recognition has been made of the need to increase local community participation in the decision-making and design of the education offered by the UACs. An increase in such participation would improve both the dialogue and impact of the UACs as development actors in the local community and northern altiplano region.
5. Although concerned with academic improvement, there remains to be a very low rate of students completing their bachelor's thesis and therefore completing their "licenciatura" (only 100 out of 500). The numbers of graduating bachelor's students must be increased in order for the validity of the UACs training to be verified. The number of students completing a thesis in their indigenous mother tongue also has to be increased in order to verify the particular rights

- aspect and exceptional nature of the training provided by the UACs. This is not a matter of infrastructural development, but of educational integrity.
6. Although both men and women work and study at the UACs there is a persisting imbalance in the sexes in terms of both numbers and roles. Mention was made in our interviews of intentions to improve this balance through the promotion of a campaign aimed at encouraging the education of young female leaders through advertisement of targeted grants. Such a campaign would be a valuable means to improve the balance of women and men studying at the UACs. Because of the particular nature of study at Pucarani, a campaign aimed at encouraging young men to study would also lead to some improvement in the balance of numbers. In addition to addressing the issue of numbers through these campaigns we also observe the need to strengthen the role of women working at the UACs. At present the administration and leadership of the UACs continues to be controlled by middle aged or older men.
  7. As separate entities the UACs frequently compete with each other over academic quality, product development, territorial coverage etc. Although some of this can be seen as friendly rivalry, our interviews made very evident the feelings amongst some of the teachers and students that much of this competition was unnecessary and disloyal. Indeed the lack of coordination between the UACs on similar initiatives, products and events only produced confusion and misunderstanding at the level of the local communities who are interested in the consultation and knowledge of the UACs. Although some cooperation has existed between the UACs in the form of sporting events, the exchange of students carrying out practice period of study and the building of a WIMAX internet connection with USAID funding, there has been no other formal planning of interaction and cooperation between the UACs. Although ostensibly aimed at generating cooperation between the UACs, because of its exclusive focus on processes of accreditation the Inter-UAC project has failed to generate wider reflection on the possible advantages of cooperation between the unit locations.
  8. The UACs have relied heavily on the support granted to them by SAIH and as a result there has been very little discussion on the issue of future sustainability. This is a critique also supported by NIBR's recent study of Norwegian NGOs in South America (ibid 2007). As a result of the tendency for planning to be limited to each individual UAC, there has been little thought given to the possible significance of the UACs as a singular project of change or of possible income generation. Although the directors and staff of the UACs know that they are viewed to be important projects for poverty reduction and indigenous empowerment there has been no thought of how this might be best profiled in order to capture joint development funds from other funding agencies. Although aware of their individual importance for the community, there has been little collective thought of their more widespread significance as models for regional/national educational innovation and drivers of development.
  9. All of the UACs have developed services and products that are of use to the local communities they are based in. Many of these services and products could be formed as an element of exchange between the four UAC locations. Indeed, consideration should be made of the possibilities to commercialise these services and products beyond the bounds of their immediate communities. As well as a vital addition to local development these services and products might also form an important source of income for the UACs. Consideration could also be made of the possibility of marketing these services and products under a common name. The formation of postgraduate courses may also be another possible source of income for the UACs. However, care needs to be taken of the costs incurred in creating and marketing these courses as well as whether such courses are commercially viable in a region of such low general economic income. The support currently given by SAIH to the UAC allows for the creation of a number of grants and keeps the tuition fees low i.e. through subsidisation teaching costs are cut by 60% meaning that students pay c120 bolivianos at the UACs compared to the more than 400 paid for tuition fees in other schools. The removal of

external support, or the commercialisation of courses would make fees difficult for most students to cover.

## UAC Batallas

The UAC is making a clear contribution to both educational development and the wider development of the local economy. Extension activities of the study of Agro-industry and Veterinary Medicine in the local areas have had a clear impact on local thinking and development initiatives. As well as consultation and training, the UAC provides the local community with a mobile veterinary hospital, a laboratory and genetic facilities. Local dairy farmers have taken an intense interest in the possibilities provided by the UAC to reduce pests and diseases and to improve the genetic stock of their livestock. They have also gained practical solutions to the industrialisation and sale of local products. The UAC were recently handed control of a trout farm built by Japanese aid money on the shores of Lake Titicaca. The project is being developed by both disciplines taught at the UAC together with the local authorities of Puerto Perez, located on the shores of Lake Titicaca. It is another important source of testing and learning for both the UAC and local community. A number of SAIH funded grants are also given to local students.

Whilst clearly local drivers of change further improvements could be made to their potential to work in line with SAIH's projected strategy. Whilst there is a good percentage of students from the local area, as well as other rural areas in the country the UAC needs to campaign to capture further local students. This could be done together with the local government, and possibly with local government funds. Whilst there are both male and female students in the UAC courses, the percentage of women needs to be increased. This is particularly important given the frequent role of women in controlling local markets. It was suggested in the course of our interviews that special grants be offered to young women interested in studying at the UAC. More effort also needs to be made to increase the number of students completing their studies and theses. This is important not only for the individual students future careers and social standing, but is of clear value in raising the academic level of the UAC. Consideration should be made of the possible expansion of the services and products already provided to the community by the UAC. It is perhaps worth noting the fact that as a foreigner the UAC director, whilst with facing more difficulty in forming links with the local community, may have better opportunity and therefore the advantage of forming technical and financial linkages with foreign NGOs and donor agencies. Consideration should be made of possible cooperation with Batallas and the exchange of students, staff and agricultural techniques.

## UAC Escoma

With its emphasis on teacher training and EIB a clear contribution is being made to both local and more widespread processes of development. The placement of students in practice situations in local community schools has a direct and positive impact on the quality of local primary level education. The formation of close links with the community and efforts to run workshops on a wide range of development issues (literacy, climate change, gender relations, democracy etc) has also a clearly positive function in the local community. The operation of the local radio station and programming of literacy, education and other information on this service is also of clear advantage to the local community. A number of SAIH funded grants are given to local students.

Again a campaign needs to be run to add to student figures, especially to those from the surrounding area. This could be run with the assistance of the local municipal and ancestral leaders. The number of students completing their theses, and those writing in Aymara also needs to be increased. The number of female students could again be increased. UAC Escoma needs to clarify its relationship with both the Instituto Normal Superior Catolico at the Catholic University in Cochabamba and the government as a normal (teachers' academy). As a result of a lack of clarity in administrative

responsibility the UAC is currently banned from taking in new students. The link formed through SAIH with the University of Urraccan<sup>7</sup> in Nicaragua should be further encouraged. The academic exchange of people and ideas between the two universities is advantageous for the further development of the UAC and its EIB proposals. UAC Escoma should consider the possibility of assisting the other UACs with the addition of an EIB perspective to their training, and in the further encouragement of students' use of Aymara/Quechua in their studies.

### UAC Tiahuanaco

In contrast to the other UACs, Tiahuanaco clearly places more emphasis on its development impact and service to the community than the academic quality of its teaching. This is not seen as entirely positive or negative. The close relationship with the local community and municipal leadership has clearly embedded the UAC as an important resource of development assistance and knowledge in the local area. The courses on Agricultural Engineering, Animal Husbandry Sciences and Tourism are highly respected by the local community and seen as relevant for local economic interests. Respect for the work of the UAC has also been increased by the programmed formation of "peritos" and teaching of *tecnico medio* workshops in rural areas throughout the altiplano region. The farm, laboratory and radio station operated by the UAC are also seen as valuable additions to the development possibilities of the community. A number of SAIH funded grants are also given to local students.

Whilst positive in its impact of service to the community, in contrast to the other UACs Tiahuanaco needs to balance this with more emphasis on its academic level. International contact with similar educational establishments in Peru and Chile should be further encouraged. More care needs to be taken to ensure the higher as well as lower level teaching at the UAC. Tiahuanaco has seen dropping students numbers over the last few years. This is something that needs to be addressed. It is also glaringly obvious that Tiahuanaco needs to spend more attention to its own infrastructural development. It is surprising that although Tiahuanaco has received funding from SAIH over a much longer period than the other UACs its physical infrastructure is the least developed. The evaluation team can only surmise that a decision has been taken by the UAC leadership to direct resources into other development priorities. Critique has also been made in interviews held at different levels of the decision making structure of the UAC. There is a clear need for decision-making to be decentralised by the director into the hands of the teaching staff of the UAC. Instead of competition, consideration should be made of possible direct cooperation and academic exchanges with UAC Batallas.

### UAC Pucarani

UAC Pucarani is clearly working in line with SAIH's strategy of education of development. The nursing training provided by the UAC is clearly of direct importance to the improvement of health services in rural districts of the Bolivian highlands. The particular emphasis of the training on public and primary health care coupled with a respect and understanding of local culture and social norms further underlines the added value of its education. UAC Pucarani is also ambitious in its desire to gain official recognition of its unparalleled local training and services. Its relationship with the Ministry of Health enables the placement of its students in hospitals and health stations throughout the Bolivian Highlands. A number of SAIH funded grants are also given to local students.

Whilst its efforts to raise its academic accreditation should be praised, tighter relations need to be formed between the UAC and the local community and municipal government. The UACs

---

<sup>7</sup> <http://www.uraccan.edu.ni/>

connected with universities in Chile and the US should be further encouraged. Consideration should be made of further possibilities to cooperate with UAC Carmen Pampa, who also offer nursing training. Whilst men and women are taking part in the UAC's courses, a campaign is needed to encourage more men from the local community to enrol. This should be coordinated with local government leaders.

### Project for the Inter-Institutional Development of the UACS (Inter-UAC)

Whilst accreditation is an important process, the concern for academic quality needs to be balanced in the case of the UACs with a emphasis on wider development impacts and service to the community. After all it is the combination of these factors that set the UACs apart from other higher education institutions in the cities. Heightened concern needs to be given by all the UACs to cooperation and to the possibility of securing other sources of financing to that of SAIH. Indeed, lengthy discussion and the formal creation of a plan for self-sustainability needs to be worked on by all the UACs. In this process it is important to include the teaching personnel as well as representatives of the local communities. The inclusion of specialised and local knowledge will help to devise a plan that is both appropriate and innovative.

### 4.3 Role in the New Political Context?

Whilst it is possible to conclude that the UACs operate as important development and rights drivers at the local level it is not so easy to form such a proactive connection at the national level. The UACs have not been important actors for change at this level, nor does it look as though that this will change under current circumstances. We see the main reasons for this as being twofold.

It is clear that the inter-cultural and bilingual education of the UACs could and should be an important example of the possibilities for education in Bolivia. However, before this can take place the persisting confusion of the country's political system will have to be addressed. Although important changes have taken place in Bolivian political culture in recent years- i.e. the inclusion of indigenous peoples in government and political decision-making and with it the re-volourisation of indigenous culture, language and of the rural population- the cycle of transformation has not yet reached a conclusive end. Open divisions on the nature of the constitution, autonomy and the redistribution of power and resources in the country hamper other efforts to introduce radical reforms, such as the proposed education reform, aimed at ending the historic marginalisation of the country's indigenous peoples. Added to this, contradictions in the current political actions and attitudes of the Morales government make the role and position of the UACs unclear. On the one hand the government endorses a policy of nationalisation whereby it aims through reform to both nationalise private universities and schools and to give increased financial support to state institutions for education. These funds are to be primarily drawn from the newly created Hydrocarbons Fund (*Impuesto Directo a los Hidrocarburos, IDH*). On the other hand the government has also been giving unclear signals to individual private universities, including the UACs, and handing out a series of grants to rural young people so that they can study at private universities in La Paz. Furthermore, although the government is in the process of introducing a new policy for agricultural production there remains no comprehensive plan for rural development (and with this rural education) in the country. Whilst individual ministers and politicians, including the ex-Minister for education, have given strong signals of approval for the form of education provided by the UACs, the continuing uncertainty of the country's political stability and reform mean that their role within wider processes of change remains undefined.

In addition to problems at the level of national government, the UACs also face serious internal problems in relation to cooperation and long-term planning. Simply put, there has not been enough

effort made to cooperate between the UACs in joint academic programmes, services and product development. Each of the UACs has operated on its own right, and at times at odds or in negative competition with the UACs. Nor has there been sufficient effort made to cooperate in the definition of a common agenda and plan for the future. As such, the vision of a role in “education for development” remains limited to personal or individual UAC interests and ignores the potential of the UACs to lead and exemplify directions for appropriate education reform at the national level. There has been too much reliance on the continuance of SAIH support. The Inter-UAC project whilst hosting important discussions on improved accreditation has not been utilised to discuss and identify other joint initiatives and to consider at depth the issue of long-term sustainability. The UAC directors and teaching staff are well aware of the “value-added” nature of the training and education they provide in the rural and indigenous context. In order to define for themselves a role as “drivers of change” in the current political context efforts should have been made to collate their experience and better profile their advantages at the national level. Indeed, SAIH have informed me of their efforts to push the UACs to do just that over the last couple of years. Although a difficult time in which to pro-actively engage with the government, the gradual process of restructuring at the national, departmental and municipal level could be advantageous to the UACs. Municipal government can for example now formally enter into agreements with private organisations in order to stimulate local economic development. The departmental governments (prefecture) also have similar powers. However, in order for this to be of any value to the UACs it is important that work be done to think through common directions and produce a formal plan for development and income generation.

## 5. Recommendations

On the basis of the analysis and conclusions above we propose the following recommendations. These recommendations are intended to generate further thought and decision making about possible strategies and scenarios for the improvement and future sustainability of the *Unidades Academicas Campesinas*:

### 1. Formation of a Unitary Governing Council for the UACs

A proposal for the formation of a unitary governing council for the UACs already exists. With thought of the challenges the UACs face in terms of their sustainability and future significance we propose support for the formation of such an entity as a means to ensure joint cooperation in planning and governance. This governing council should include representatives of the local communities where the UACs are located.

### 2. Appointment of specialist directors and decentralisation of decision-making

The combined administrative and religious roles of the UAC directors, limits their time and ability to focus on the developmental and educational needs of these institutions. In order to meet future challenges and improve the quality of teaching in each, the UACs require more specialised leadership (preferably individuals with educational and administrative experience). Given the source and need for increased integration of knowledge about teaching needs, challenges and scientific advances there is also a need for decision-making to be decentralised amongst the teaching staff.

### 3. Inclusion of local leaders and community in decision-making

Whilst links exist between the UACs and the local communities and there are clear impacts on local possibilities for development, the anchorage of the institutions in the community could be strengthened. As well as more in line with SAIH's own support for participatory development, inclusion of local leaders and community representatives in the direction and content of teaching would also help to ensure the validity of the training and education in local area. Inclusion of local leaders may also lead to improved knowledge of local political processes as well as knowledge of and arrangements for public financing.

### 4. Intensive joint consideration of the private and public viability of the commercialisation of services and products.

All of the UACs produce services (e.g. veterinary and medical consultation, laboratory services, genetic stock improvement, workshops and training) and products (e.g. milk, cheese, vegetables, water pumps, teaching materials, scientific results) that could be commercialised. Although it is unlikely that these services and products could produce enough income to make the UACs self-sufficient, they are nonetheless seen as possible sources of income that can add to that of external sources.

### 5. Exchange of services and products between the UACs

There are services and products that could be exchanged or sold between the UACs themselves. As well as continuing the practice of student placement this could also include teaching materials and methods, scientific results, the use of laboratories and other infrastructure and a range of academic and agricultural products. Increased activity of this nature might help to cut costs as well as improve academic possibilities.

#### 6. Conclusion of the legal process for full membership of the Catholic University of Bolivia (UCB)

Under current conditions we do not see separation from the Catholic University or church as viable options. Too much is gained through their accreditation level, prestige and patronage. It is, however, important for the current legal process led by the UAC central office in La Paz to be pushed through to a positive conclusion. With *de jure* recognition, as opposed to the *de facto* arrangement of today, as institutions for higher education administered by the Catholic University there will be better grounds for the UACs to also appeal for increased financing by the university. Whilst remaining under the umbrella of the Catholic University discussion should be made with the rector and university leadership of valid models for restructuring the organisation of the UACs. Here the example of Uruccan in Nicaragua is of interest.

#### 7. Exploration of new laws and reforms

The current political situation is both troubling and confusing. However, with this said positive advances are being made in policy thinking and reform. The UACs need to work together to track the developments in thinking and reform and to lobby for favourable inclusion within the new governmental and legal structures.

#### 8. Exploration of other foreign and national donors

Whilst a number of the UACs have already entered into agreements with other foreign and national NGOs, a more comprehensive effort should be made to map and identify possible external financing. Again cooperation, rather than competition, in contacting these organisations and communication of a clearly unified profile may help to secure larger sums of funding from which all would benefit.

#### 9. Creation of a UAC Fund in the US or Europe

Although not part of this evaluation, it was evident from a number of our interviews that the UAC at Carmen Pampa in the Yungas had been successful in capturing funds to support its work because of the establishment of a help fund in the US. We suggest that consideration be made of creating a similar, but joint, UAC fund in the US or Europe. This may be something that SAIH could help to create through drawing on its contacts with other interested organisations and European universities.

#### 10. Strengthening and formation of links with foreign universities

A number of contacts and student exchanges already exist between the UACs and foreign universities in neighbouring countries and the US. These contacts and exchanges should be encouraged and expanded. These relations are important means to improve student mobility, education, teaching quality and can also lead to financial support.

#### 11. Strengthening of Rights Focus

Although satisfied that the UACs are working in line with Norad guidelines for *specific support*, we also detect that more could be done in each location to teach and reflect on the meaning, significance and use of indigenous rights and rights discourses in general. Indeed, we suggest that rights become an explicit focus in all the curriculum used by the UACs, however technical they might otherwise be.

#### 12. Creation of international grants

The support granted by SAIH has already ensured the creation of grants in each of the UAC location. For this the students of the UACs are extremely grateful, given that for many it has given them the only means and opportunity to study. With this said, on a number of occasions student also mentioned their desire for a number of special grants to be formed that would not only provide incentive to finish and continue their studies in Bolivia, but offer opportunity to



study abroad. The students are well aware that a foreign degree is given much more value in Bolivia than domestic qualifications. The formation of such specialist grants would have to be funded by external funding, but relations with foreign universities might help with this.

#### 13. Encourage Student Completion of Theses and Degrees

The teachers at the UACs are rightly proud of the students completing their bachelors theses in Aymara and Spanish. Unfortunately, in all of the UACs there is still a very low percentage of the students completing their theses and degrees compared to students in the city. In order for the quality of teaching to be assured and accreditation improved the numbers of students completing their studies in this way needs to be increased.

#### 14. Campaign for Gender Balance

Further improvement to the balance of men and women working and studying at the UACS should be made. A campaign aimed at addressing the imbalance in numbers, but also of gender roles in the administration and leadership of the UACs needs to be promoted.

#### 15. Definition of a conclusion to SAIH funding

We see that as a result of SAIH's stable history of funding, many of those working in the leadership and staff of the UACs continue to assume that support will continue without end. As a result of their dependency and this assumption, insufficient action has been taken to discuss the issues of future sustainability and income. Other than the renewal of support for ongoing infrastructural and academic development in the three yearly development plans submitted to SAIH by the UACs there little sign of desired progress and ambitions, or of thought towards identifying routes to other sources of income and financing. To stimulate serious consideration of future sustainability it is suggested here that SAIH give a clear indication of the limits of its funding, and possibly identify a period of time (three to five years) at the end of which the UACs will have to guarantee and operate a plan for their own future. It is suggested that SAIH and all of the UACS participate in defining and agreeing on this period of time and as well as the contents of an eventual plan for sustainability.

## Annex 1. TÉRMINOS DE REFERENCIA

### 1. Antecedentes

El fondo de asistencia internacional de los estudiantes y académicos noruegos (SAIH), es la organización de solidaridad y cooperación internacional de estudiantes y académicos en Noruega. Con el lema "Educación para la liberación", SAIH quiere contribuir a la liberación económica, política, civil, social y cultural en el Sur, y fortalecer la solidaridad internacional entre estudiantes y académicos en Noruega y en países en el Sur. SAIH apoya a proyectos educativos en Bolivia, Nicaragua, Sudáfrica, Zambia y Zimbabwe, y realiza campañas informativas en Noruega. Este año en SAIH se ha implementado la Estrategia para la educación para el desarrollo 2008-2012 para guiar las actividades de la organización.

#### Antecedentes: SAIH en Bolivia

En el año 1993 SAIH empezó una cooperación con la Unidad Académica Campesina de Tiahuanaco en el altiplano de Bolivia. La cooperación fue financiada por La Campaña Día Laboral (OD) en el contexto de la campaña de 500 años de resistencia de los pueblos indígenas al colonialismo. Fue el inicio del trabajo de SAIH con pueblos indígenas en Bolivia, que enfoca en educación adecuada a la necesidad del campo boliviano y los derechos de los pueblos indígenas. Actualmente los proyectos de SAIH en Bolivia son parte del programa "Educación para el fortalecimiento de los derechos de los pueblos indígenas y minorías étnicas" (2006-2008), con el apoyo de NORAD. Las Unidades Académicas Campesinas (UACs) son contrapartes importantes para SAIH en este trabajo.

#### Las Unidades Académicas Campesinas

Las Unidades Académicas Campesinas que son contrapartes de SAIH están estratégicamente domiciliadas en Batallas, Escoma, Pucarani y Tiahuanaco, poblaciones indígenas del departamento de La Paz, Bolivia. Son instituciones de educación superior que tienen su techo académico de la Universidad Católica Boliviana "San Pablo". Legalmente, su funcionamiento está facultado por la Ley de la República de Bolivia N° 1545 del 21 de marzo de 1994 y convenios suscritos entre el Obispado de la Diócesis de El Alto y la Universidad Católica Boliviana "San Pablo" con cada una de las Unidades Académicas Campesinas.

Las Unidades Académicas Campesinas fueron creadas por la Iglesia Católica de Bolivia, con la finalidad de disminuir las tremendas injusticias sociales vividas por la población indígena en Bolivia durante toda su vida republicana. Entre las décadas 70 y 80 del anterior milenio la vida en las comunidades indígenas del altiplano fue insostenible debido a los desastres naturales de sequías e inundaciones, ocasionando gran magnitud de migración definitiva de la población joven hacia las principales ciudades de Bolivia y el exterior (Chile, Argentina, Brasil) como mano de obra no calificada empeorando su situación social y económica.

Líderes indígenas, preocupados por la despoblación de las comunidades indígenas, el incipiente desarrollo productivo tecnológico agropecuario, bajas condiciones de vida (salud, vivienda) y la ausencia de apoyo del estado para su desarrollo, promovieron estrategias para superar la gran problemática de este sector, planteando la idea de iniciar un proceso de formación profesional de jóvenes del campo para el campo; ésta idea fue asumida por algunos párrocos de la Iglesia Católica de La Paz quienes emprendieron el desafío de materializar una institución de educación superior en las poblaciones indígenas.

Las UACs de Batallas, Pucarani y Tiahuanaco, fueron fundadas en 1986. En el año 1995 la Universidad Católica Boliviana "San Pablo", incorporó en su estructura orgánica al Instituto de

Desarrollo Rural (IDR) como instancia de relación con el sector rural y la supervisión del funcionamiento de las Unidades Académicas Campesinas Batallas, Pucarani y Tiahuanaco.

UAC Escoma es una normal privada con el techo académico de la Normal Católica de Cochabamba. La administración de UAC Escoma esta a cargo del Instituto Normal Superior Católico “Sedes Sapientiae” (INSCSS).

La creación de las UACs tiene alto impacto de reivindicación social-educativa, ya que se enfrentan problemas fundamentales como la postergación y discriminación de los pueblos originarios del sector, en aspectos raciales, sociales, económicos, laborales y de género; además de otros aspectos derivados de la pobreza del entorno, traducida en baja calidad de vida.

Actualmente las UACs están en un proceso de ver hacia el futuro, considerando la posibilidad de ser regionales de la UCB y viendo otras posibilidades de organización e identidad que les pueda ayudar a obtener sostenibilidad y acreditación internacional como instituciones de educación superiores.

## **2. Presentación de los proyectos**

### *UAC Batallas*

La cooperación entre SAIH y la UAC Batallas se inicio en 1999. El convenio actual del “Proyecto Medicina Veterinaria y Zootecnia” tiene como objetivo desarrollar la carrera para seguir capacitando académicamente en una rama fundamental para el altiplano boliviano, respetando el ecosistema y la cultura regional. La Carrera de Medicina Veterinaria y Zootecnia se ha potencializado con moderna infraestructura, materiales y equipos, y los jóvenes estudiantes reciben capacitación de primer nivel sin salir de su entorno social y cultural. Al momento se cuenta con jóvenes varones y mujeres titulados en el área que se encuentran desarrollando producciones pecuarias familiares, prestando servicios médicos veterinarios en sus zonas de acción generando sus propias microempresas.

### *UAC Escoma*

La cooperación entre UAC Escoma y SAIH se inicio en 2003. El proyecto actual (2006-2008) se llama “Formación de docentes en educación intercultural bilingüe (EIB)”. Con la base en el enfoque pedagógico de EIB en Bolivia, UAC Escoma como institución de educación superior, responde a la necesidad de fortalecer el idioma y la cultura materna de los pueblos indígenas y mejorar la calidad de la enseñanza en el sistema educativa. Para cumplir este propósito se firmó convenio interinstitucional entre SAIH y el Instituto Normal Superior Católico “Sedes Sapientiae” (INSCSS)-UAC Escoma. Se está contribuyendo económicamente para la implementación y mejora de infraestructura, equipamiento, capacitación y otras, con el propósito de elevar la calidad educativa.

### *UAC Pucarani*

UAC Pucarani tiene convenio con SAIH desde el año 1998. El actual “Proyecto Fortalecimiento Institucional UAC Pucarani” (2006-2008) tiene como meta fortalecer la educación superior de enfermería para el campo. En el año 1999 se logro crear e implementar la licenciatura en enfermería, y los proyectos han continuado fortaleciendo la institución con infraestructura, equipamiento y mejora de la calidad académica. UAC Pucarani busca educar a jovenes mujeres y hombres con la base necesaria y adecuada a la cultura local y nacional, para contribuir a mejorar la situación de salud en el país, con un enfoque especial en las realidades del campo boliviano.

### *UAC Tiahuanaco*

La cooperación entre SAIH y UAC Tiahuanaco se inicio en 1993. El actual “Proyecto Plan trineal gestion 2006-2008 UAC Tiahuanaco” sigue el proceso de desarrollo que desde el inicio buscaba dar una oferta academica en las ramas de agronomía y zootecnia. En la primera etapa se busco el

mejoramiento de la calidad educativa, la promoción del liderazgo de los estudiantes y el desarrollo de la proyección social universitaria hacia las comunidades campesinas de Tiwanaku. En la segunda etapa la cooperación contribuía a la creación y funcionamiento de las carreras de Licenciatura en Ingeniería Agronómica e Ingeniería Zootécnica, a través de ampliación de la infraestructura y mejora de la calidad académica e administrativa.

#### *Proyecto de Desarrollo Interinstitucional de las UACs*

El trabajo interinstitucional coordinado entre las UACs fue iniciado en 2005. El actual “Proyecto de desarrollo interinstitucional Unidades Académicas Campesinas Batallas, Escoma, Pucarani, Tiahuanaco” tiene como objetivo trabajar hacia obtener la acreditación internacional de las UACs como instituciones de educación superior, a través del MERCOSUR Educativo. El proyecto ha pasado por varias etapas y esta en su último año.

### **3. Justificación de la evaluación**

SAIH quiere hacer una evaluación externa de la cooperación con las UACs por varias razones:

- a. Hay un nuevo contexto político en Bolivia, en que la situación de los pueblos indígenas ha cambiado a nivel macro
- b. SAIH actualmente cuenta con la Estrategia para la Educación para el Desarrollo de SAIH 2008-2012, y se quiere ver la cooperación actual y planes del futuro en relación a esta estrategia
- c. La cooperación ha durado varios años y SAIH necesita saber más de los resultados y beneficios de los proyectos

### **4. Objetivos de la evaluación**

- a. Interpretar e analizar el rol de las UACs en el nuevo contexto político en Bolivia y proponer estrategias para el futuro
- b. Presentar y evaluar los resultados y desafíos de los proyectos para que puede ayudar a las UACs planificar y mejorar su trabajo
- d. Presentar y evaluar los resultados y desafíos de los proyectos para que puede ayudar a SAIH planificar programas para el futuro y tener contrapartes relevantes
- e. Proponer estrategias de cooperación y sostenibilidad para el futuro

### **5. Alcance y temática de la evaluación**

La evaluación debe iluminar tres preguntas globales:

1. Hasta que punto se han fortalecido las UACs como instituciones de educación superior con un enfoque en los pueblos indígenas a través de la cooperación con SAIH?
2. Qué rol juegan las UACs en el nuevo contexto político de Bolivia?
3. Como están relacionadas las UACs con la Estrategia para la Educación para el Desarrollo 2008-2012 de SAIH?

Para poder presentar respuestas a estas preguntas globales, la evaluación debe analizar, interpretar y presentar recomendaciones acerca de los siguientes aspectos de la cooperación entre las UACs y SAIH:

a. Efectividad

Cómo han sido fortalecidos como instituciones de educación superior las UACs a través de la cooperación con SAIH (nivel académico, administrativo, infraestructura)?

b. Eficiencia

Cuál es la coherencia entre los resultados de los proyectos y los insumos económicos?

c. Impacto

Qué rol juega y puede jugar las UACs como agentes de cambio en la sociedad en un nuevo contexto político en Bolivia?

d. Pertinencia

-Cómo se relacionan el trabajo y la identidad de las UACs y la cooperación entre las UACs y SAIH con el programa actual “Educación para el fortalecimiento de los derechos de los pueblos indígenas y minorías étnicas” (2006-2008)?

-Cómo se relacionan el trabajo y la identidad de las UACs y la cooperación entre las UACs y SAIH con la Estrategia para la Educación para el Desarrollo de SAIH 2008-2012?

-Hasta que punto hay un valor agregado para las UACs en la cooperación con SAIH aparte del apoyo económico?

e. Sostenibilidad

-Cómo se puede asegurar la sostenibilidad del trabajo para seguir desarrollando una oferta de educación superior para los y las jóvenes indígenas del campo, como ha buscado hacer los proyectos de cooperación entre las UACs y SAIH?

f. Enfoque indígena

Hasta que punto se puede decir que la cooperación entre SAIH y las UACs ha fortalecido y beneficiado a jóvenes indígenas directamente en las UACs y los pueblos indígenas de nivel local y departamental?

Cómo se expresa y muestra un enfoque indígena en cada uno de las UACs?

g. Género

Hasta que punto se puede decir que haya un enfoque de género en el trabajo de las UACs?

Cómo se puede trabajar bajo un enfoque de género en el futuro?

## 6. Metodología

Se usará una combinación de métodos para conseguir la información necesaria:

1. Revisión de documentos (la Estrategia para la Educación para el Desarrollo de SAIH, evaluaciones previas, informes y documentos fundamentales sobre y de los proyectos)
2. Entrevistas individuales con informantes claves
3. Entrevista de grupos
4. Observación directa

## 7. Equipo de evaluación

Se contratará un equipo de 2 evaluadores, una/o de Noruega (líder) y otro/a de Bolivia. Tiene que considerarse el aspecto de género.

El líder de la evaluación tiene que cumplir con los siguientes requisitos:

- a. Tener experiencia significativa con evaluación
- b. Hablar y escribir fluente el español y adicionalmente el noruego y/o inglés

- c. Tener experiencia de trabajo con/en Bolivia y conocimiento específico y profundo sobre el contexto y la situación actual político y social de Bolivia
- d. Tener conocimiento de la temática de pueblos indígenas
- e. Conocer bien el campo de trabajo de desarrollo y tener experiencia de trabajo con la temática

SAIH selecciona el equipo de la evaluación basado en solicitudes.

### **8. Plan de trabajo**

La evaluación tendrá las siguientes fases (aprox. 6 semanas):

Preparación (revisión de documentos): 1 semana

Trabajo de campo: 2-3 semanas, entrevistas, visitas, informe preliminar (mayo)

Elaboración del informe final: 1-2 semanas (junio)

### **9. Contactos**

-Rectores, estudiantes, responsables de carrera de las UACs

-Líderes y representantes de las comunidades cerca de y relacionadas con las UACs

-Instituto de Desarrollo Rural (IDR) de la Universidad Católica Boliviana

-Representantes de SAIH (entrevista de grupo con Ragnhild Nordvik, Lise Ulvedal y Arnhild Helgesen)

### **10. Informes y uso de los resultados**

El informe preliminar se presentará a los representantes de las UACs (con la presencia de SAIH), con el objetivo de poder asimilar comentarios y opiniones de las partes involucradas en la cooperación.

El informe final (aprox. 30 páginas) de la evaluación se entregará en forma digital e impresa en inglés o noruego y español para el 30 de junio 2008. Debe incluir un resumen con recomendaciones.

Annex 2: SAIH Financing 2006-2008

GLO-05/272 SAIH 2008 - Revidert etter tilsagn, Styremøte 01b-08

Org. %	NORADs andel av kostnader	SAIHs andel av kostnader	Adm.bidrag 8% av NORADs andel	NORAD total bidrag Prosj + Adm	Kostnader totalt prosjekt	Evalueringer	Kostnader andre	Kostnader reise	Kostnader revisjon	Kostnader faglig bidr.	Direkte prosjekt-kostnader	Dir. kostn USD kurs 5,7
15,00	1 458 175	257 325	116 654	1 574 829	1 715 500		50 000	30 000	4 000	64 000	1 567 500	275 000
	931 175	164 325	74 494	1 065 669	1 095 500			30 000	4 000	64 000	987 500	175 000
15,00	1 556 775	274 725	124 542	1 681 317	1 831 500			25 000	4 000	64 000	1 738 500	305 000
15,00	1 072 275	189 225	85 782	1 158 057	1 261 500			25 000	4 000	64 000	1 168 500	205 000
15,00	248 625	43 875	19 890	268 515	292 500			25 000	4 000	64 000	199 500	35 000
	<b>5 267 025</b>	<b>929 475</b>	<b>421 362</b>	<b>5 688 387</b>	<b>6 196 500</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>135 000</b>	<b>20 000</b>	<b>320 000</b>	<b>5 671 500</b>	<b>995 000</b>
<b>BOLIVIA</b>												
15,00	563 550	99 450	45 084	608 634	663 000			25 000	4 000	64 000	570 000	100 000
	805 800	142 200	64 464	870 264	948 000			25 000	4 000	64 000	855 000	150 000
15,00	769 675	135 825	61 574	831 249	905 500			25 000	4 000	64 000	712 500	125 000
15,00	712 130	125 670	56 970	769 100	837 800	100 000	136 800	20 000	4 000	64 000	513 000	90 000
15,00	753 100	132 900	60 248	813 348	886 000			20 000	4 000	64 000	798 000	140 000
15,00	498 950	88 050	39 916	538 866	587 000			20 000	4 000	64 000	399 000	70 000
15,00	193 800	34 200	15 504	209 304	228 000						228 000	40 000
	<b>4 297 005</b>	<b>756 295</b>	<b>343 760</b>	<b>4 640 765</b>	<b>5 055 300</b>	<b>300 000</b>	<b>136 800</b>	<b>135 000</b>	<b>24 000</b>	<b>384 000</b>	<b>4 075 500</b>	<b>715 000</b>
	<b>9 564 030</b>	<b>1 687 770</b>	<b>765 122</b>	<b>10 329 152</b>	<b>11 251 800</b>	<b>300 000</b>	<b>166 800</b>	<b>270 000</b>	<b>44 000</b>	<b>704 000</b>	<b>9 747 000</b>	<b>1 710 000</b>
<b>ZIMBABWE</b>												
15,00	626 025	110 475	50 052	676 107	736 500			30 000	4 000	64 000	598 500	105 000
15,00	1 134 750	200 250	90 780	1 225 530	1 335 000			30 000	4 000	64 000	1 197 000	210 000
15,00	504 800	89 100	40 352	545 252	594 000			30 000	4 000	64 000	456 000	80 000
15,00	613 275	108 225	49 052	662 327	721 500			25 000	4 000	64 000	598 500	105 000
15,00	613 069	108 192	49 047	662 136	721 281			29 781	4 000	64 000	598 500	105 000
	<b>3 482 039</b>	<b>616 242</b>	<b>279 363</b>	<b>3 771 402</b>	<b>4 108 281</b>	<b>179 781</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>140 000</b>	<b>20 000</b>	<b>320 000</b>	<b>3 448 500</b>	<b>605 000</b>
<b>ZAMBIA</b>												
15,00	893 775	157 725	71 502	965 277	1 051 500			30 000	4 000	64 000	883 500	155 000
15,00	627 300	110 700	50 184	677 484	738 000			30 000	4 000	64 000	570 000	100 000
15,00	117 610	20 790	9 425	127 255	138 600			25 000	4 000	64 000	45 600	8 000
15,00	319 500	56 400	25 568	345 168	376 000			25 000	4 000	64 000	285 000	50 000
	<b>1 958 485</b>	<b>345 615</b>	<b>156 679</b>	<b>2 115 164</b>	<b>2 304 100</b>	<b>70 000</b>	<b>70 000</b>	<b>110 000</b>	<b>12 000</b>	<b>258 000</b>	<b>1 784 100</b>	<b>313 000</b>
<b>REGIONALT</b>												
15,00	1 189 150	209 850	95 132	1 284 282	1 399 000			30 000	4 000	68 000	1 197 000	210 000
	<b>1 189 150</b>	<b>209 850</b>	<b>95 132</b>	<b>1 284 282</b>	<b>1 399 000</b>	<b>100 000</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>30 000</b>	<b>4 000</b>	<b>68 000</b>	<b>1 197 000</b>	<b>210 000</b>
	<b>6 639 674</b>	<b>1 171 707</b>	<b>531 174</b>	<b>7 170 848</b>	<b>7 811 381</b>	<b>349 781</b>	<b>70 000</b>	<b>280 000</b>	<b>36 000</b>	<b>646 000</b>	<b>6 429 600</b>	<b>1 126 000</b>
	<b>16 203 704</b>	<b>2 859 477</b>	<b>1 286 296</b>	<b>17 500 000</b>	<b>19 063 181</b>	<b>649 781</b>	<b>256 800</b>	<b>550 000</b>	<b>80 000</b>	<b>1 350 000</b>	<b>16 176 600</b>	<b>2 836 000</b>
	<b>17 500 000</b>											

Kommentarar:  
 Kostnader andre: URACCAN; Samarbeid med Høgskulen i Sør-Trøndelag  
 Kostnader andre: UAC-Batalias; Felleprosjekt for alle UACane, knytt til internasjonal akkreditering  
 Kostnader andre: ZARAN; Samarbeid med Juse-Buss  
 Prosjektkostnader Youth Media; Kostnader knytt til avslutning av samarbeidet (sluttføring av rekneskap og revisjon)

2007

Org. %	NORADS andel av kostnader	SAIHs andel av kostnader	Adm.bidrag % av NORAD andel	NORAD total bidrag	Kostnader totalt prosjekt	Kostnader				Direkte prosjekt- kostnader	
						andre	reise	revisjon	faglig bidr.		
15,00											
<b>NICARAGUA</b>											
0,15	1 613 300	281 641	129 064	1 742 364	1 894 941	100 000	15 280	4 000	7 566 1	1 700 000	
0,15	971 550	168 391	77 724	1 049 274	1 139 941		15 280	4 000	7 566 1	1 045 000	
0,15	1 579 300	275 641	126 344	1 705 644	1 854 941		15 280	4 000	7 566 1	1 760 000	
0,15	899 300	155 641	71 944	971 244	1 054 941		15 280	4 000	7 566 1	960 000	
0,15	268 600	44 341	21 488	290 088	312 941		15 280	4 000	7 566 1	218 000	
	0	0	0	0	0						
	<b>5 332 050</b>	<b>925 655</b>	<b>426 564</b>	<b>5 758 614</b>	<b>6 257 705</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>76 400</b>	<b>20 000</b>	<b>378 305</b>	<b>5 683 000</b>	
<b>BOLIVIA</b>											
0,15	644 300	111 474	51 544	695 844	755 774		16 117	4 000	75 657	660 000	
0,15	917 150	158 624	73 372	990 522	1 075 774		16 117	4 000	75 657	980 000	
0,15	755 650	130 124	60 452	816 102	885 774		16 117	4 000	75 657	790 000	
0,15	849 150	146 624	67 932	917 082	995 774	380 000	16 117	4 000	75 657	520 000	
0,15	857 650	148 124	68 612	926 262	1 005 774		16 117	4 000	75 657	910 000	
0,15	415 650	70 124	33 252	448 902	485 774		16 117	4 000	75 657	390 000	
	0	0	0	0	0					0	
0,15	98 430	17 370	7 874	106 304	115 800	65 800				50 000	
	<b>4 537 980</b>	<b>782 462</b>	<b>363 038</b>	<b>4 901 018</b>	<b>5 320 442</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>96 700</b>	<b>24 000</b>	<b>453 942</b>	<b>4 300 000</b>	
	<b>9 870 030</b>	<b>1 708 117</b>	<b>789 602</b>	<b>10 659 632</b>	<b>11 578 147</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>173 100</b>	<b>44 000</b>	<b>832 247</b>	<b>9 983 000</b>	
<b>ZIMBABWE</b>											
0,24	494 525	149 655	39 562	534 087	644 180	0	35 298	4 000	57 382	547 500	
0,19	1 099 513	256 418	87 961	1 187 474	1 355 930	0	35 298	4 000	57 382	1 259 250	
0,25	422 700	136 980	33 816	456 516	559 680	0	35 298	4 000	57 382	463 000	
0,23	500 050	150 630	40 004	540 054	650 680	0	35 298	4 000	57 382	554 000	
0,23	500 050	150 630	40 004	540 054	650 680	0	35 298	4 000	57 382	554 000	
	0	0	0	0	0	0				0	
	<b>3 016 838</b>	<b>844 313</b>	<b>241 347</b>	<b>3 258 185</b>	<b>3 861 150</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>176 490</b>	<b>20 000</b>	<b>286 910</b>	<b>3 377 750</b>	
<b>ZAMBIA</b>											
0,22	574 708	163 996	45 977	620 685	738 704	80 000	39 253	4 000	52 618	562 833	
0,25	428 508	138 196	34 281	462 789	566 704		39 253	4 000	52 618	470 833	
0,20	845 008	211 696	67 601	912 609	1 056 704		39 253	4 000	52 618	960 833	
	0	0	0	0	0					0	



Sum Zambia	1 848 224	513 889	147 858	1 996 082	2 362 113	0	80 000	117 760	12 000	157 854	1 994 499
REGIONALT		0									
GLO 01/419-xx Regionalt HIV/AIDS	0,15	1 098 250	197 729	87 860	1 186 110	1 295 979		17 256	4 000	74 723	1 200 000
Sum Regionalt		1 098 250	197 729	87 860	1 186 110	1 295 979	0	17 256	4 000	74 723	1 200 000
Sum Afrika		5 963 312	1 555 930	477 065	6 440 377	7 519 242	0	80 000	36 000	519 487	6 572 249
Total forventet ramme		15 833 342	3 264 047	1 266 667	17 100 009	19 097 389	0	625 800	80 000	1 351 734	16 555 249

## NORAD-prosjekter 2006 - revidert budsjett etter tilsagn (mars 06)

Org. %	NORADS andel av kostnader	SAIHs andel av Kostnader	Adm.bidrag 8% av NORADS andel	NORAD total bidrag Prosj + Adm	Kostnader totalt prosjekt	Evalueringer	Kostnader andre	Kostnader reise	Kostnader revisjon	Kostnader faglig bidr.	Direkte prosjekt-kostnader
<b>NICARAGUA</b>											
18,00	1 569 480	344 520	125 558	1 695 038	1 914 000	16 000	100 000	25 000	4 000	69 000	1 700 000
18,00	900 360	197 640	72 029	1 098 000	1 098 000			25 000	4 000	69 000	1 000 000
18,00	1 228 360	269 640	98 269	1 326 629	1 498 000			25 000	4 000	69 000	1 400 000
18,00	900 360	197 640	72 029	1 098 000	1 098 000			25 000	4 000	69 000	1 000 000
17,00	454 840	93 160	36 387	491 227	548 000			25 000	4 000	69 000	450 000
	0	0	0	0	0						
	<b>5 053 400</b>	<b>1 102 600</b>	<b>404 272</b>	<b>5 457 672</b>	<b>6 156 000</b>	<b>16 000</b>	<b>100 000</b>	<b>125 000</b>	<b>20 000</b>	<b>345 000</b>	<b>5 550 000</b>
<b>BOLIVIA</b>											
17,00	806 474	165 181	64 518	870 992	971 655	2 000		25 000	5 000	69 000	870 655
17,00	992 265	203 235	79 381	1 071 646	1 195 500	57 500		26 000	5 000	69 000	1 038 000
17,00	900 135	184 365	72 011	972 146	1 084 500	227 500		26 000	5 000	69 000	787 000
17,00	570 625	116 875	45 650	616 275	687 500	57 500		26 000	5 000	69 000	530 000
17,00	859 050	175 950	68 724	927 774	1 035 000			26 000	5 000	69 000	935 000
17,00	471 025	96 475	37 682	508 707	567 500	57 500		26 000	5 000	69 000	410 000
17,00	0	0	0	0	0						0
	<b>4 599 574</b>	<b>942 081</b>	<b>367 966</b>	<b>4 967 540</b>	<b>5 541 655</b>	<b>402 000</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>155 000</b>	<b>30 000</b>	<b>414 000</b>	<b>4 540 655</b>
	<b>9 652 974</b>	<b>2 044 681</b>	<b>772 238</b>	<b>10 425 212</b>	<b>11 697 655</b>	<b>418 000</b>	<b>100 000</b>	<b>280 000</b>	<b>50 000</b>	<b>759 000</b>	<b>10 090 655</b>
<b>Sum Latin-Amerika</b>											
<b>ZIMBABWE</b>											
17,00	581 000	119 000	46 480	627 480	700 000	0		26 000	5 000	69 000	600 000
17,00	894 740	183 260	71 579	966 319	1 078 000	0	20 000	26 000	5 000	69 000	1 300 000
17,00	514 600	105 400	41 168	555 768	620 000	0	20 000	26 000	5 000	69 000	500 000
17,00	630 800	129 200	50 464	681 264	760 000	0		26 000	5 000	69 000	660 000
17,00	597 600	122 400	47 808	645 408	720 000	0	20 000	26 000	5 000	69 000	600 000
	0	0	0	0	0	0					0
	<b>3 218 740</b>	<b>659 260</b>	<b>257 499</b>	<b>3 475 239</b>	<b>3 878 000</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>60 000</b>	<b>130 000</b>	<b>25 000</b>	<b>345 000</b>	<b>3 660 000</b>
<b>ZAMBIA</b>											
17,00	646 570	132 430	51 726	698 296	779 000			25 000	5 000	69 000	600 000
17,00	513 770	105 230	41 102	554 872	619 000			25 000	5 000	69 000	500 000
17,00	945 370	193 630	75 630	1 021 000	1 139 000			25 000	5 000	69 000	1 000 000
	0	0	0	0	0						0
	<b>2 105 710</b>	<b>431 290</b>	<b>168 457</b>	<b>2 274 167</b>	<b>2 537 000</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>140 000</b>	<b>75 000</b>	<b>15 000</b>	<b>207 000</b>	<b>2 100 000</b>
<b>REGIONALT</b>											
18,25	1 226 280	273 720	98 102	1 324 382	1 500 000			26 000	5 000	69 000	1 400 000
	<b>1 226 280</b>	<b>273 720</b>	<b>98 102</b>	<b>1 324 382</b>	<b>1 500 000</b>			<b>26 000</b>	<b>5 000</b>	<b>69 000</b>	<b>1 400 000</b>
<b>Sum Afrika</b>											
	<b>6 550 730</b>	<b>1 364 270</b>	<b>524 058</b>	<b>7 074 788</b>	<b>7 915 000</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>200 000</b>	<b>231 000</b>	<b>45 000</b>	<b>621 000</b>	<b>7 160 000</b>
<b>Total forventet ramme</b>											
	<b>16 203 704</b>	<b>3 408 951</b>	<b>1 296 296</b>	<b>17 500 000</b>	<b>19 612 655</b>	<b>418 000</b>	<b>300 000</b>	<b>511 000</b>	<b>95 000</b>	<b>1 380 000</b>	<b>17 250 655</b>
<b>TILSAGN FOR 2005 FRA NORAD</b>											
	<b>17 500 000</b>										

Kommentarer til endringer: Grunnet feilbudsjettering på UAC Tiwanaku er 160 000 nok flyttet fra CIVNET til UAC Tiwanaku. I tillegg er det kuttet på andre prosjekter i Bolivia for å nå nærmere opp til UAC Tiwanakus søkandsum. Totalsummens på akreditering til UACene (under evaluering) er av praktiske grunner endret. En større sum ligger ved Pucrani ettersom de koordinerer akrediteringen. 2000 kroner er lagt inn under evaluering på CDIMA til revisjonsgjennomgå 16 000 nok er satt av til reise til Samisk høyskole for utvikling av EIB under URACCANS norgesbesøk

## Annex 3: LISTA DE ENTREVISTADOS/AS

LOCALIDAD	UNIDAD/ INSTITUCIÓN / ORGANIZACIÓN	NOMBRE	CARGO
Ciudad de Oslo	SAIH	Arnhild Helgesen	Coordinadora de Proyectos, Bolivia
		Ragnhild Therese Nordvik	Director general
		Lise Ulvedal	Coordinadora de Proyectos, Nicaragua
		Jonas Holmqvist	Leader of SAIH
Ciudad de La Paz	Dirección General de las UACs	Alberto Abastafior	Director general
		Lourdes Vélez	Coordinadora académica
		Fernando Rosas	Organización y auditoría
		Nelly Camacho	Auditora
	Universidad Católica Boliviana	Hans Vandenberg	Rector
	Ministerio de Educación	Ismael Quispe	Encargado de evaluación y desarrollo curricular de las Universidades Privadas
Reunión con varios funcionarios		Unidad de Universidades Privadas	
Embajada de Noruega	Finn Arne Moskvil	Consejero	
Batallas	UAC Batallas	Richard Cenker	Director UAC Batallas
		Ana María Camacho	Directora de carrera
		Jesús Huallpa	Secretario en la administración
		Wilfredo Pauckal	Docente y director del Instituto de Investigaciones
		Gina Muñoz Reyes	Docente
	Gobierno Municipal	Máximo Lavra Vargas	Representante del Municipio
Autoridades locales	Simón Flores Quispe	Ex Central Agraria	
Escoma	UAC Escoma	Padre René Marca	Director UAC Escoma
		Ascencio Cahuaya	Director académico
		Boris Rodriguez	Contador
		Tomas Quispe Huañapaco	Docente
		Sonia Millán Sánchez	Docente
		Mario Aliaga Luque	Estudiante representante
		Hugo Luis Condori Mamani	Estudiante representante
	Autoridades locales	Juan Mamani Machu	Ex autoridad
Tiahuanacu	UAC Tiahuanacu	Padre Claudio Patty	Director UAC Tihuanacu
		Mario Acho Nina	Director de carrera
		Ramiro Mamani	Responsable del departamento de investigación e interacción social
		Eusebio Callami	Docente
		Wilfredo Marin	Docente
		Patricia Cespedes	Directora de carrera
		Edwin Rubén Cornejo	Estudiante representante
	Genaro Paniagua Cabezas	Estudiante representante	
Gobierno Municipal	Elogia Quispe Cabrera	Alcaldesa	

		Laureano Coronel Quispe	Presidente del Consejo
		Mercedes Tonconi	Consejala
	Autoridades locales	Gerardo Condori Condori	Mallku Cantonal
<b>Pucarani</b>	UAC Pucarani	Padre Tomas Cornejo	Director UAC Pucarani
		Luciana Laruta	Directora de carrera
		Rosminda Marco Huallpa	Administradora
		José Ernesto Vallejos	Docente
		Martiza Irigoy	Docente
		Roció Díaz	Docente y coordinadora de la parte asistencial
		Jimena Churqui	Docente y encargada del departamento de investigación
		Dalila Loyda Mamani Coy	Estudiante practicante en la Provincia Omasuyos
		Estudiantes	Estudiantes de pre-universitario y segundo semestre
	Autoridades locales de Corapata	Martín Chávez	Secretario de agricultura
		Francisco Gabriel Chaque	Secretario de educación
		Luciano Tapia Huanca	Presidente de la zona 3
		Alejandro Federico Chávez	Secretario de hacienda de la zona 2
		Santiago López	Secretario de deportes

## Bibliography

- Borchgrevink, A & McNeish, J (2007) Review of Bistandsnemda's (Norwegian Missions in Development) Work with Indigenous Peoples. CMI/Norad Report.
- Hall, G. & Patrinos, H. A. (eds) (2006) *Indigenous Peoples, Poverty and Human Development in Latin America*, Palgrave Macmillan, New York.
- Hernani, W. (2002) Mercado laboral, pobreza y desigualdad en Bolivia. Instituto Nacional de Estadísticas: Bolivia (INE), Informe No. 1.
- Instituto Nacional de Estadísticas de Bolivia (2006) *Características Sociodemográficas de la Población*, INE, La Paz.
- Landa, F. (2002) *Pobreza en Bolivia 1999 y 2001*. UDAPE: La Paz.
- McNeish, J.A (2006) *Stones on the Road: The Politics of Participation and the Generation of Crisis in Bolivia*. Bulletin of Latin American Research, Vol 25. No 2.
- Ministerio de Educación y Culturas de Bolivia (2006). Nueva Ley de la Educación Boliviana “Avelino Siñani y Elizardo Pérez” Anteproyecto de Ley. La Paz.
- NIBR (2007) *State of the Art Study: Development Cooperation through Norwegian NGOs in South America*
- NORAD (2004) *Norway's Efforts to Strengthen Support for Indigenous Peoples in Development Cooperation: A Human Rights-based Approach*. Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs.
- SAIH (2008) *Education for Development Strategy: “Education for Liberation: Development Based on Knowledge and Solidarity 2008-2012*.

## Recent Reports

**R 2008: 6**

Strand, Arne (team leader) et al.: Return with Dignity, Return to What? Review of the Voluntary Return Programme to Afghanistan. Bergen, 2008, 70 pp.

**R 2008: 5**

LANGE, Siri, with Elias M. Songoyi: The Norad Programme in Arts and Cultural Education. A Mid-Term Review of the Programme Period 2006-2008/9. Bergen, 2008, 44 pp.

**R 2008: 4**

KOLSTAD, Ivar, Arne Wiig and Heidi Larsen: Hvordan gjøre gode ting bedre? Norske bedrifters CSR aktiviteter i utviklingsland. Bergen, 2008, 53 pp.

**R 2008: 3**

WIIG, Arne, Farah Ghuznavi and Alf Morten Jerve: Mid-Term Review of the Country Programme (MoU:2003-2008) between Norway and Bangladesh. Bergen, 2008, 49 pp.

**R 2008: 2**

LANGE, Siri: Land Tenure and Mining in Tanzania. Bergen, 2008, 33 pp.

**R 2008: 1**

SØREIDE, Tina and Claudio Weber Abramo: Collaboration on Anti-Corruption Norway and Brazil. Bergen 2008, 24 pp.

**R 2007: 18**

MÆSTAD, Ottar and Eamonn Brehony: Review of Haydom Lutheran Hospital. External Review Contracted by the Royal Norwegian Embassy, Dar es Salaam. Bergen, 2007, 44 pp.

**R 2007: 17**

MÆSTAD, Ottar: Rewarding Safe Motherhood: How can Performance-Based Funding Reduce Maternal and Newborn Mortality in Tanzania? Bergen, 2007, 35 pp.

**R 2007: 16**

WIIG, Arne, Line Tøndel, Espen Villanger with contribution from Ottar Mæstad: Will International Trade Reduce Poverty? A Background Note to Norad. Bergen, 2007, 46 pp.

CMI's publications, Annual Report and quarterly newsletters are available on CMI's homepage [www.cmi.no](http://www.cmi.no)



## SUMMARY

Responding to the Terms of Reference determined by SAIH for this study the main questions asked in this evaluation are: 1. To what degree has the cooperation with SAIH strengthened the UACs as higher education institutions with particular focus on indigenous peoples? How do the UACs relate to SAIH Strategy for Education for Development 2008-2012? What role do the UACs play in the new political context of Bolivia?

On the basis of field research and a series of interviews carried out in May 2008, the evaluation concludes positively in response to the first two of these questions. The evaluation concludes that the cooperation with SAIH has strengthened the UACs as higher education institutions with particular focus on indigenous peoples. It concludes that the UACs are evidently working in line with SAIH's strategy for "education for development". The evaluation describes in detail the basis of these qualitative judgements. Whilst returning positive answers to these questions the evaluation does, however, underline that a range of improvements need to be made by the UACs in order to ensure their sustainability and to develop and expand their significance as "actors for change". The evaluation concludes that as a result of poor foresight and cooperation, coupled with the confusing and divided political reality of Bolivian politics, the UACs do not currently play an important role in the new political context of Bolivia. Work needs to be done to better cooperate and profile the particular inter-cultural and bilingual education offered by the UACs in a range of appropriate areas for local development.

Printed version: ISSN 0805-505X

Electronic version: ISSN 1890-503X

Printed version: ISBN 978-82-8062-2268-6

Electronic version: ISBN 978-82-8062-269-3

Chr. Michelsen Institute (CMI) is an independent, non-profit research institution and a major international centre in policy-oriented and applied development research. Focus is on development and human rights issues and on international conditions that affect such issues. The geographical focus is Sub-Saharan Africa, Southern and Central Asia, the Middle East, the Balkans and South America.

CMI combines applied and theoretical research. CMI research intends to assist policy formulation, improve the basis for decision-making and promote public debate on international development issues.